Basics of Clinical Mentoring

Participant Handbook
Table of Contents

Table of contents ........................................................................................................................................... i
Training agenda ............................................................................................................................................... ii

About This Course
I. Overview........................................................................................................................................ iii
II. What will I learn in this course? ........................................................................................................ iii
III. How is this course organized? ........................................................................................................... iii
IV. What ground rules are used during the training course? ................................................................. iv
VI. How do I use this Participant Handbook? ....................................................................................... v
VII. How can I learn most effectively in this course? ........................................................................... v

Course Sessions
Session 1: What is Clinical Mentoring........................................................................................................ 1-1
Session 2: Building Relationships ............................................................................................................. 2-1
Session 3: Effective Communication and Feedback Skills ....................................................................... 3-1
Session 4: Theories of Learning................................................................................................................ 4-1
Session 5: Clinical Teaching Skills ......................................................................................................... 5-1
Session 6: Clinical Diagnosis and Decision-Making Skills ..................................................................... 6-1
Session 7: Addressing Systems Issues..................................................................................................... 7-1
Session 8: Case Studies............................................................................................................................ 8-1
Session 9: Program Orientation ............................................................................................................... 9-1
## Sample Training Agenda

*This schedule is approximate and may vary depending on the specific needs of each training.*

### Day 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>08:30–09:00</td>
<td>Registration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:00–09:15</td>
<td>Welcome address</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:15–10:45</td>
<td>Session 1: What is Clinical Mentoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:45–11:15</td>
<td>Tea break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:15–12:00</td>
<td>Session 2: Building Relationships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:00–13:00</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:00–14:30</td>
<td>Session 3: Effective Communication and Feedback Skills (break for tea after 90 minutes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:30–15:00</td>
<td>Tea break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:00–16:00</td>
<td>Session 3: Effective Communication and Feedback Skills (continued)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:00–16:30</td>
<td>Evaluation and close</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Day 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>08:30–08:45</td>
<td>Questions from Day 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08:45–10:00</td>
<td>Session 4: Theories of Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00–10:30</td>
<td>Tea break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30–11:45</td>
<td>Session 5: Clinical Teaching Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:45–12:45</td>
<td>Session 6: Clinical Diagnosis and Decision-Making Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:45–13:45</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:45–15:15</td>
<td>Session 7: Addressing Systems Issues (break for tea after 90 minutes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:15–15:45</td>
<td>Tea break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:45–16:15</td>
<td>Session 7: Addressing Systems Issues (continued)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:15–16:45</td>
<td>Evaluation and close</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Day 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>08:30–08:45</td>
<td>Questions from Day 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08:45–10:00</td>
<td>Session 8: Case Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00–10:30</td>
<td>Tea break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30–12:00</td>
<td>Session 8: Case Studies (continued)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:00–13:00</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:00–14:00</td>
<td>Session 9: Program Orientation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:00–14:30</td>
<td>Tea break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:30–15:30</td>
<td>Session 9: Program Orientation (continued)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:30–16:30</td>
<td>Final evaluation and close</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
About This Course

I. Overview
Mentoring is a challenging task that requires flexibility, skill in coordinating disparate stakeholders, excellent communication and relationship-building skills, and the ability to cope with rapid change of direction, in addition to possessing up-to-date clinical knowledge and teaching skills. This 3-day generic curriculum on basic mentoring skills aims to ensure that clinical mentors are well prepared for their work. Country projects can adapt and tailor this curriculum to meet their specific needs.

Topics covered within this curriculum include giving feedback effectively, rapport building, bedside teaching, addressing systems issues, starting a mentoring assignment, and accessing clinical resources. Sessions are designed based on principles of adult learning theory. They include a variety of participatory exercises and activities designed to build confidence and skills in clinical teaching, as well as provide guidance on how to approach a mentoring assignment.

I. What will I learn in this course?
The aim of this training course is to provide participants with the skills and knowledge necessary to be an effective clinical mentor.

At the end of the course, it is expected that participants will be able to:

- Define clinical mentoring
- Identify mentoring strategies
- Explain the benefits of clinical mentoring
- Describe how to build a positive relationship with a mentee
- Demonstrate effective feedback and communication skills
- Explain how the principles of adult learning theory apply to clinical mentoring
- Apply the domains of learning to clinical mentoring
- Choose the appropriate mentoring strategy for a given teaching moment
- Identify the principles of evidence-based medicine
- Discuss strategies for addressing common systems issues at health care facilities
- Reflect on personal motivations and beliefs about mentoring

II. How is this course organized?
The design of this course reflects the assumption that participants are professional health care workers who are well-qualified and who may have a wide variety of experience in the field of clinical mentoring. A variety of approaches to teaching and learning will be adopted, with the underlying assumption that participants are adult learners who will take considerable responsibility for their own learning. The focus will be on active learning, and
should emphasize the key knowledge and skills needed for individuals who will be serving as clinical mentors.

The course is a facilitator-led program and consists of nine sessions. Sessions include the following teaching/learning methods:

• Lecture
• Case studies
• Role plays
• Large and small group discussions
• Individual work

On average, sessions will last between 1 and 3 hours. You will receive a morning, lunch, and afternoon break if the training is all day.

The knowledge and skills that participants bring to the course are important to the learning process, and participants are encouraged to share their knowledge and skills and to raise issues that may be challenging to clinical mentors.

III. What ground rules are used during the training course?

To help ensure that time spent at the training is both productive and enjoyable, there are some rules and procedures that we ask participants to follow. The following information includes details on general procedures of the course and requirements for completing it. These ground rules are not meant to constrain participants but to contribute to a quality learning environment for everyone.

A. Identifying expectations

At the beginning of the course, the facilitator will ask participants what they expect to learn from the course. This information will be recorded on flip chart paper and displayed for the duration of the course. The facilitator will identify which expectations are within the description of the course and which fall outside. This will help participants understand what the course will and will not cover.

B. Determining group norms

It is important for course participants to establish and commit to their own group norms on the first morning of the course. The facilitator will lead a brainstorming exercise at the beginning of the course to establish group norms. The following are examples of group norms:

• Respect each other’s confidentiality
• Respect each other’s contributions, questions, and opinions
• Be on time
• Participate fully in discussions and exercises
• If you must leave a session early, please inform the Course Director or facilitator for that session before the session begins
• Turn off mobile phones
IV. How do I use this Participant Handbook?

The Participant Handbook was developed to assist you and enhance learning as you participate in the course. The handbook contains the following information:

- Table of contents
- Training schedule
- About this course
- Course sessions:
  - Worksheets
  - Handouts
  - Copies of PowerPoint slides with background information

Refer to the Participant Handbook frequently throughout the course. The facilitators will refer to it during each course session.

V. How can I learn most effectively in this course?

There are five important things that you can do as a participant to help create an effective learning atmosphere for yourself, all course participants, and facilitators.

C. Help to build an atmosphere of trust and support

One of the best ways to help build an atmosphere of trust and support is to listen thoughtfully to the ideas of other participants and provide constructive feedback that will help improve the learning for everyone. Let someone know if they’ve said or done something that you like. And help a fellow participant or facilitator if you see he or she is having a challenging moment. The best learning takes place in a humane environment; help us to build one!

D. Maintain a positive attitude

There will be times during the course when you might say to yourself, “I’m so tired!” That’s okay to say because you will be working hard and expending a lot of energy learning new things. But try to stay positive and productive as you participate in each session. Negativity does not support a quality learning environment.

E. Contribute to the learning of others

Participants are the most valuable resource in a training course. They help each other learn through sharing relevant work experiences and providing different perspectives. If you see yourself and your fellow participants as resources, you will learn so much more than if you rely solely on the course facilitators for learning the course content. Ask other participants questions, engage them in conversation, and consider sharing relevant examples from your own work experience.

F. Participate actively

A common assumption is that an active participant in a training course is someone who talks a lot. Not true! Participating actively actually requires more listening than talking. Looking at an individual as they are speaking, nodding your understanding, or using facial expressions that indicate “I’m listening” are active forms of listening.
Another way to actively participate in this training course is to contribute ideas during group exercises, answer questions posed by the facilitators, and ask your own questions of participants and facilitators. In short, participating actively means that it is apparent to others that your brain is on and attentive to each session’s activities.

G. Provide useful feedback at the end of the day

Because we believe that your perspective about how this course is progressing is crucial, we will ask you to give us feedback on each day’s session. Your enjoyment, learning and understanding of the day’s content will be the focus of this feedback and should not take you long to complete. Please do provide us with this feedback so that we can monitor and evaluate the progress of the course. Thank you!
Session 1: What Is Clinical Mentoring

Participant Handbook

Basics of Clinical Mentoring
Session 1: What Is Clinical Mentoring

Time: 90 minutes (1 hour, 30 minutes)

Learning Objectives
By the end of this session, participants will be able to:
• Define clinical mentoring and distinguish it from supportive supervision
• Understand the rationale for, and objectives of, clinical mentoring
• Outline characteristics of effective mentors
• Explain challenges to mentoring

Handouts
• Handout 1.1: Mentoring vs. Supportive Supervision (Slide 14)

Key Points
• Clinical mentoring seeks to strengthen district health care systems by providing continuing education to health care workers (HCWs), and working towards creating more efficient clinical settings.
• Clinical mentoring involves relationship-building, identifying areas for improvement, coaching and modeling, advocacy, and data collection and reporting.
• Effective mentors are respectful, teach and learn, and are adept at physical diagnosis and enthusiastic about teaching.
Session 1: What Is Clinical Mentoring

Basics of Clinical Mentoring

Slide 2

Learning Objectives
By the end of this session, participants will be able to:
- Define clinical mentoring and distinguish it from supportive supervision
- Understand the rationale for, and objectives of, clinical mentoring
- Outline characteristics of effective mentors
- Understand challenges to mentoring

Slide 3

Partner Brainstorm
What Is Clinical Mentoring?
There are a variety of definitions for clinical mentoring. The most important components are:

- Clinical mentors are experienced clinician trainers who provide case review, problem solving, quality assurance and continuing education.
- They provide increased access to hands-on HIV training for health care workers in resource-poor settings.
- A mentor’s ultimate goal is to help each team member to be the best they can be, and do the best job possible to help maximize the number of positive outcomes for PLHIVs.
I-TECH’s Definition of What Clinical Mentors Do

I-TECH approach includes 5 key components:

- Building relationships
- Identifying areas for improvement
- Responsive coaching and modeling of best practices
- Advocating for environments conducive to good patient care and provider development
- Collecting and reporting on data

Building relationships. Establishment of a trusting and receptive relationship between the mentor and mentee(s) is the foundation for an effective mentoring experience. This component is ongoing over the course of the mentorship, as the relationship continues to evolve and grow.

Identifying areas for improvement. This component involves observation and assessment of existing systems, practices, and policies to identify areas for improvement. I-TECH has developed a number of tools that can help with this assessment phase. Information obtained during this assessment helps to inform the establishment of goals and objectives for the mentorship.

Responsive coaching and modeling of best practices. Mentors must demonstrate proper techniques and model good practices. During on-site mentoring, this means examining patients along with the mentee; using appropriate, systemic examination techniques with gloves when appropriate; and hand washing. Mentorship is as much about setting a good example as it is about directly intervening to improve mentee practice.

Advocating for environments conducive to quality patient care and provider development. This component relates to technical assistance in support of systems-level changes at the site. Mentors work with colleagues to enhance the development of clinical site infrastructure, systems, and approaches that can support the delivery of comprehensive HIV care. For example, mentors might provide technical assistance in support of proper flow of patients at the facility, advocate for provision of privacy for patients during examination, or help to promote a multidisciplinary approach to HIV care at the site.

Collecting and reporting on data. Mentors support the use and integration of patient data into clinical practice, and can help to demonstrate the utility of data collection and reporting to mentees during the mentorship. For example, in Tamil Nadu, data on patients lost to follow-up was collected and discussed with mentees, which lead to an analysis of causes and solutions, and ultimately to a decrease in the cases lost. A similar positive result occurred with analysis of time of initiation of ART in TB-HIV co-infected patients. Mentors guide using these 5 steps.

**Why Clinical Mentoring?**

- Decentralization of HIV care and ART
- Strengthening the district health care system
- Task-shifting
- Transitioning to chronic HIV care
- Standardized content and care pathways
- Continuing education

**Decentralization:** Decentralization to district health centers and hospitals allows increased access, equity, and better support of adherence to ART.

**Strengthening district health centers:** Decentralizing HIV care and ART requires capacity-building at 1st and 2nd level facilities so they can provide services that have previously been restricted to specialized referral centers.

**Task shifting:** Tasks can be shifted from more-specialized to less-specialized health care workers—research shows that non-specialist doctors, clinical officers, and nurses can effectively deliver HIV-related clinical services, including ART.

**Transitioning:** Because many resource-constrained countries are starting to provide life-sustaining ART, more people will be engaging with the health care system in an ongoing, chronic care relationship for the rest of their lives. The care system will help them as they work to manage their illnesses, adhere to treatment, and self-manage simple symptoms.

**Standardized content and care pathways:** Standardized, simplified clinical protocols and operating procedures make task-shifting easier. Such protocols should be displayed and easily-referenced.

**Continuing education:** Few countries have a continuing education system, so there is little follow-up with trainees after initial training.

Expertise in managing ART and opportunistic infections is often **not** available in health care teams in various settings that are rapidly scaling up their HIV treatment services.

While the clinical mentor should have a superb knowledge base, the next slides show the multifaceted nature of mentoring, and the importance of components outside of clinical knowledge.

It is crucial that the mentor have up-to-date information, with a solid base of knowledge about HIV disease management, as care and treatment approaches change rapidly.

What you do as a mentor is really all about relationships. You are fully present and empathetic, and you find ways to connect, with heart, to another human being.

Building this relationship takes time, and is an ongoing process, even over years of working together.

Think about the core values you share with this human being. Many peoples’ list includes a commitment to:

- Optimal care for PLHIV
- Lifelong learning
- Advocacy of basic human rights and women’s rights
- A credo of ethical medical care
- The idea that all people have a right to medical care

It is important to communicate to the mentee that you want to be there. Keep in mind that you are a guest in their space, and this should be respected always.
As a mentor, you must begin by paying attention. You are making careful observations about what is already going on, at every level. This means learning about the culture and the setting you are visiting.

- You observe the system of care, the teamwork among the staff, and the knowledge and clinical skills of the ones you are mentoring. For each team member there are skills to observe.
  - How does the pharmacist educate the patient?
  - How does the counselor teach adherence?
  - How does the receptionist help the new client feel comfortable?
- There may be opportunities to discuss stigma, confidentiality, etc. These are subtleties that are important to recognize when you are mentoring.
  - How does the health care worker greet the next patient? Do they just yell out the name of the next patient or do they walk out to greet them?
Beyond your observations, you must be actively listening. This means paying attention to the patient, health care worker, pharmacist, counselor, nurse, data entry person.

- Mentors must listen without judgment.
- The question of “why” is integral to good mentoring:
  - “Tell me why you ordered that medication for the side effect.”
  - “Tell me why you decided to order the chest x-ray.”
- Open-ended questions are useful for learning the mentee’s motivation. Open-ended questions are questions that cannot be answered with a single word, and therefore encourage meaningful answers.
- Open-ended questions often begin with “Tell me,” “Why,” or “How.” Compare the following ways of asking the same thing:
  - “You didn’t think cotrimoxazole prophylaxis was indicated for this patient?”
  - “Tell me more about your decision not to start cotrimoxazole prophylaxis with this patient.”

Mentors are role models all the time: The way mentor looks, approaches patients, speaks, etc.

- How you act with patients and colleagues will be noticed.
- In each interaction your relationship and communication skills are crucial.

Feedback is given from mentor to mentee, but also from mentee to mentor.

- Mentors are always learning, the learning does not stop when you are a mentor.
• Growth and learning happen over time. Relationships deepen over time. Ideally there will be return visits, ongoing emails or mobile calls, or some other form of follow-up and continuation, but that is not always feasible.

• In rural areas, mobile consults are one way to achieve continuity. In one I-TECH program, nurses in HIV clinics have the mobile phone numbers of nurse mentors to get immediate answers to questions.

Activity: Mentoring vs. Supportive Supervision (1)

What activities/duties fall in each category?

Which fall into both categories?

See Handout 1.1 for this diagram.

Handout 1.1: Mentoring vs. Supportive Supervision (Slide 14)

**Supportive supervision**
- Space, equipment, forms
- Supply chain management
- Training, staffing, other human resource issues
- Entry points
- Patient satisfaction

**Clinical mentoring**
- Patient flow and triage
- Clinic organization
- Patient monitoring and record-keeping
- Case management observation
- Team meetings
- Review of referral decisions

- Clinical case review
- Bedside teaching
- Journal club
- Morbidity and mortality rounds
- Assist with care and referral of complicated cases
- Available via distance communication
Mentor ≠ Preceptor

- Mentor: Guides mentee through entire course of training: physical exam to advanced, complex, end-of-life care
- Preceptor: Works alongside student, directs his/her learning by telling him/her what to look for, how to look for it
- 2-way discussion with open-ended questions
- Teaches by modeling, not only intellectual skills but also empathy/compassion
- Telling, not showing

- The “preceptor” model is more directive than the clinical mentoring model.
- Many medical professionals were trained with a preceptor model, so it may be the default teaching style
- Mentoring, however, employs different techniques, and is more of an even, two-way discussion than a question-and-answer session led by the mentor.
- Depending on the level of the mentee, a mentor may need to use the preceptor model to teach a mentee. As the mentee becomes more clinically efficient, the mentor should emphasize mentoring technique more often.

Characteristics of a Good Mentor

- Adept at physical diagnosis
  - Working knowledge of possible diagnoses and issues that may need addressing
- Enthusiastic and comfortable incorporating diverse situations/experiences into teaching
- Takes a “back-seat” approach to teaching, avoiding extensive lectures
  - Allows mentor to explore and learn on his/her own
- Understanding of clinical systems to address systemic issues

- Remember that mentoring is not just for clinical procedures, but for systems as well.

Characteristics of Effective Mentorship Relationships

- Relationship is warm, safe, respectful, trustful
- Both mentor and mentee want to be involved in mentoring relationship
- Mentor listens to learner and the learner knows it
- Mentor/mentee are able to process misunderstandings
- Continuity of the relationship over time
- Power is shared
- Learning is two-way, mentor is interested in learner’s ideas

- Relationship-building continues over the span of the mentorship–even years into the relationship.
- Can think about mentoring as a dance between the mentor and mentee–it is fluid, with each person requesting information from the other, back and forth.
  - Mutual learning
### Activity

What are some challenges in conducting clinical mentoring?

### Challenges to Mentoring (1)

Obstacles to health care working (HCW) learning:
- Stress due to intra-clinic factors (e.g., heavy patient load, disorganization)
- Personal distractions
- HCWs stressed by mentor’s presence in clinic

### Challenges to Mentoring (2)

- Defensiveness
- Putting on one’s “best show,” not the typical show, for the visiting mentor
- Bad (as opposed to best) practices
- Varying availability of resources from clinical site to clinical site
- Clinical site infrastructure and systems in need of mentoring

- The arrival of a mentor can be a set up for defensiveness in our colleagues, “What? You don’t think I know what I am doing?”
- We all like to put on our best when someone is watching, but those are not the “day to day” practices we want to help improve.
- What to do when we directly observe “bad” as opposed to “best” practices? And what do we do when we encounter unethical practices?
- More interpersonal challenges to mentoring will be discussed in the next unit.
Key Points

- Clinical mentoring seeks to strengthen district health care systems by providing continuing education to HCWs, and working towards creating more efficient clinical settings.
- Clinical mentoring involves relationship-building, identifying areas for improvement, coaching and modeling, advocacy, and data collection and reporting.
- Effective mentors are respectful, teach and learn, are adept at physical diagnosis, and enthusiastic about teaching.
Session 2: Building Relationships

Participant Handbook

Basics of Clinical Mentoring
Session 2: Building Relationships

⏰ Time: 45 minutes

Learning Objectives

By the end of this session, participants will be able to:

• Explain the importance of building a relationship with a mentee that is based on trust, mutual respect, and an understanding of cultural differences
• Identify potential barriers to relationship-building
• Identify techniques for building rapport
• Practice affirming statements

Worksheets

• Worksheet 2.1: Examining Cultural Differences
• Worksheet 2.2: Affirming Statements

Key Points

• Relationships are the foundation of effective clinical mentoring.
• Strategies to build rapport include listening, patience, eye contact, use of affirming statements.
• There can be barriers to building mentorship relationships based on cultural differences and expectations, as well as personal factors. Mentors can come prepared with strategies to overcome these barriers.
Session 2: Building Relationships

Basics of Clinical Mentoring

Learning Objectives

By the end of this session, participants will be able to:

- Explain the importance of building a relationship with a mentee that is based on trust and mutual respect
- Identify potential barriers to relationship-building
- Identify techniques for building rapport
- Practice affirming statements

• Remember this diagram from the last session.
• A strong relationship is at the core of effective mentoring.
Building a Relationship (2)

- Mentor/mentee relationship can range from a week to months or years.
  - It is necessary to find a way to connect with your mentee, even if the time frame is short.
  - It is important to understand mentee’s social and cultural environment.
  - Note that methods of communication will vary according to age, social class, urban vs. rural setting.

Activity: Cultural Differences

Think about who you are and what kind of setting (cultural, socioeconomic, ethnic) you are coming from and compare that to your mentees’ setting.

- Refer to Worksheet 2.1 and complete the worksheet in pairs.
# Worksheet 2.1: Examining Cultural Differences

**Instructions:**

- Fill out the chart below for yourself as the mentor. Then fill out the mentee column based on what you generally know about the people you will be mentoring.

- Pair up to discuss your charts and consider the questions below the chart. You will debrief these questions and this activity as a large group once you are finished.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>You, the mentor</th>
<th>Your mentee(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race/ethnicity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National/regional origin</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Profession</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level of education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other: health issues, etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. How might the differences between your column and the mentee column affect your mentee’s attitude:
   
   a. Upon meeting you?
   
   b. As you begin interacting with him/her?
   
   c. As you begin providing feedback about his/her performance?

2. How might these differences affect your attitude:
   
   a. Before meeting your mentee? Upon meeting him/her?
   
   b. As you start building a relationship with him/her?

3. When confronted with situations that are not immediately comfortable, what are some steps you, as a mentor can take in order to overcome the discomfort/mistrust?

4. If your columns are more similar than different, what implications might that have for your mentor/mentee relationship?
Rapport

- Establishing rapport is the first phase of effective communication, which includes greeting, welcoming, showing that you care, and have time for the mentee.

Techniques for Building Rapport

- Shake hands
- Introduce yourself
- Use same language as mentee
- Show patience, do not interrupt
- Make eye contact (if appropriate)
- Do not attend to other tasks while speaking with mentee
- Say “yes”, “um-hum,” or a nonverbal gesture so they know you are interested and engaged
- Use affirming statements

Affirming Statements

- Affirm: To acknowledge the positive in someone else to support and encourage that person to build upon his or her successes.
- Affirming statements are words of encouragement that increase mentees belief in themselves and their abilities.

- The next slides will elaborate on affirming statements and will give participants some practice using them.

- Using affirming statements is one technique used to help build rapport.
- Affirmation encourages mentees to build upon their successes.
- Modeling affirming statements will both encourage further success among mentees, as well as model behavior that health care workers (HCWs) can (and should) use with their patients.
### Slide 9
**Affirming Statements: Examples**
- I can see that you really connect with your patients.
- You handled that challenging situation very well.
- That was a difficult diagnosis to make—well done!
- I like the way that you spoke to the patient and his family.

Directly affirming and supporting the mentee during the mentoring process is an important way of building rapport and reinforcing your relationship, as well as encouraging exploration. Compliments or statements of appreciation and understanding are examples of affirming statements.

- Affirmations will differ by culture and setting. The point is to appropriately and consistently appreciate the mentee’s strengths and efforts.

### Slide 10
**Affirmation Dialogues**
- Mentee: I almost forgot to give a physical exam!
  - Mentor: But you remembered! You are really improving in that respect.
- Mentee: I finally felt a connection with Mrs. V.
  - Mentor: I noticed that she seemed to trust you!
- Mentee: I was unsure of how to react to Mr. F’s comment.
  - Mentor: I liked how you answered in a nonjudgmental way.

These are three examples of dialogues between a mentor and mentee.

Note how these statements can be used to build mentees’ self-confidence.

### Slide 11
**Activity: Affirming Each Other**
- Write down 3-4 positive accomplishments or efforts you have made as a health care worker or in patient care.
- Pair up with a new partner.
- Take turns reading your accomplishments.
- Partner should respond with an affirming statement.

The accomplishments do not have to be grand accomplishments, but rather can be small positive gains or even efforts that were not completely successful.

Refer to Worksheet 2.2 for this activity.
Worksheet 2.2: Affirming Statements

Instructions:

• Use the space provided below to write down three to four positive accomplishments or efforts you have made as a health care worker in patient care.

• Pair up with the person next to you. Reach each of your accomplishments and allow your partner to respond with an affirming statement.

• Switch roles so each partner has the chance to read their accomplishments and provide affirming statements.

• Follow instructions from the facilitator to debrief this activity.

Positive Accomplishments

1.

2.

3.

4.
Key Points

- Relationships are the foundation of effective clinical mentoring.
- Strategies to build rapport include listening, patience, eye contact, use of affirming statements.
- There can be barriers to building mentorship relationships, based on cultural differences and expectations, as well as personal factors. Mentors can come prepared with strategies to overcome these barriers.
Session 3: Effective Communication and Feedback Skills

Participant Handbook

Basics of Clinical Mentoring
Session 3: Effective Communication and Feedback Skills

Time: 150 minutes (2 hours, 30 minutes)

Learning Objectives
By the end of this session, participants will be able to:
• Identify the basic principles of feedback
• Explain the important role of feedback in the context of clinical mentoring
• Demonstrate effective communication styles and constructive feedback

Worksheets
• Worksheet 3.1: PITC Scenario and Feedback Role Play
• Worksheet 3.3: Feedback Scenarios

Handouts
• Handout 3.2: Basic Principles of Giving Feedback

Key Points
• Good communication—both verbal and nonverbal—is essential for an effective mentoring relationship.
• Communication techniques, such as appropriate body language, active/reflective listening, and summarizing, can aid communication.
• Feedback is integral to adult learning, and is a vital component of the clinical mentoring relationship.
This session will present basic concepts about feedback, but will also try to look at feedback from within a clinical mentoring context.
Types of Communication

Communication can be either:
- **Verbal**: Spoken words
- **Nonverbal**:
  - The way we stand and sit
  - Facial expressions
  - Silence
  - Eye contact
  - Gestures (smiling, leaning forward, nodding)

- Note that only 7 to 11% of all communication is verbal, and the rest is nonverbal.
- Nonverbal communication may not always match a verbal message.
- Differences in how messages are perceived can lead to confusion.

Activity: Nonverbal Communication

What do these mean?

- We often communicate without words. For example:
  - Drumming
  - Storytelling
  - Drama
  - Visual images
  - Written and spoken language
  - Hand signals
- People use nonverbal communication signs instead of expressing themselves verbally because they may feel uncomfortable expressing emotions such as anger, boredom, confusion verbally.
- This relates to the mentor-mentee relationship in that she clinical mentor needs to be aware both of what the health care worker might be communicating nonverbally to him/her, and what he/she as a mentor is communicating nonverbally to the health care worker (HCW).
Effective communication means that the correct message goes from the sender to the receiver successfully, in the way the sender intended. Just because a message is sent does not mean that it was received accurately.

Effective communication requires the ability of both the sender and the receiver to:
- Listen
- Pay attention
- Perceive what the other is trying to communicate
- Respond verbally or nonverbally; i.e., react

Effective communication is more than just providing information or giving advice. It involves asking questions, listening carefully, trying to understand a mentee’s concerns or needs, demonstrating a caring attitude, and helping to solve problems.

Communication Process
- A message sender creates a message for the message receiver.
- The receiver and the sender react, asking for more information and getting answers, to find out whether the message has been understood.

Communication Skills
Techniques for effective communication include:
- Active listening
- Reflecting
- Summarizing
Active Listening (1)

- Is an essential component of good communication.
- Often, instead of truly listening to what the other person is saying, we're thinking about what our response will be to what they're saying, or what we want to say next, or something else entirely.

Active Listening (2)

Task:
Each speaker should talk for 1–2 minutes about a topic of their choice (it does not have to be work-related), while the facilitator keeps time. The listener cannot say anything, but must convey active listening using nonverbal skills. The pairs should switch roles and repeat the exercise at the facilitator’s prompting.

- As the speaker, how did it feel to talk for that long without being interrupted?
- When you were the listener, how did it feel to listen? Why?
- How does this exercise apply to your mentoring?

Activity: Active Listening

- Divide into pairs
- Each pair should choose a listener and a speaker
Reflective Listening builds on active listening.

Reflective Listening (1)
Process of verbally “reflecting” back what someone has said:
- Helps the mentor check whether s/he understands the mentee
- Helps the mentee feel understood and respected as a health care worker

Reflective Listening (2)
Confirm that you have understood the mentee by using statements such as:
- “So you feel like there’s not enough time to do a complete physical exam.”
- “It sounds like you’re concerned about this patient’s ability to adhere to treatment.”
- “You’re wondering if this patient should be started on an ART regimen.”

Note that the sample statements include the word “you,” which emphasizes that the mentor is actively listening and reflecting back what the mentee has said. This helps to check for understanding.
Activity: Reflective Listening

• Under normal circumstances, it is natural to mix reflection with other skills, but in this exercise, practice reflecting **only**.
• Group members should switch roles after 2 minutes. Each person should practice speaking, listening, and observing.
• Each group member should pick one topic from the list below (it is okay for group members to use the topic if they like).

Topics:
• Describe what makes a good friend.
• Describe an accomplishment you are proud of.
• Talk about your earliest memory.
• Describe the best vacation you have ever taken.
• Talk about a scary experience you have had that turned out well.
• Talk about someone you admire and why.
• Describe a childhood experience that you remember fondly.
• If you had a day to do anything you wanted, describe what you would do.

Summarizing (1)

- Process of synthesizing and stating what a mentee has said in order to capture key concerns and issues
- Helps to make sure the message that is sent is the message that is received

Summarizing is another skill we will practice that may be useful for communication with your mentee.
**Summarizing (2)**

Use summarizing:
- To check that you have understood the mentee’s story or issue
- When changing topics, closing discussion, or clarifying something
- To collect your thoughts
- To show the mentee that you have heard and respect his/her point of view

**Suggested topics:**
- If no gloves are available, should HCWs still draw blood, manage deliveries, etc., i.e., without gloves?
- HCWs who test HIV-positive should not be allowed to work in the hospital.
- Women who are HIV-positive should not have children.
- HCWs should be allowed to refuse to take care of HIV-positive patients if they wish.
- Pregnant patients should not have a choice about HIV testing; it should be mandatory.

**Activity: Summarizing**
Communication can be hindered by a number of things. This picture depicts a scene in which many barriers to communication exist. What are they?

Other ways of not communicating well include:
- Looking out the window.
- Looking at the clock or watch.
- Starting to speak to someone else.
- Shuffling papers.

Negative nonverbal communication can have many consequences, such as:
- Information is not shared, understood.
- The client may ask fewer questions.
- Problem may be difficult to understand.
- Situation may be uncomfortable.
- Lack of adherence to medical appointments and/or treatment.

Note that this picture depicts an HCW with a patient, not a mentor and mentee. However, the same barriers to communication could exist between a mentor and mentee. Alternatively, this is a scene that a mentor might observe in the clinic and give feedback to a mentee about.

The last slide dealt primarily with nonverbal barriers to communication. This slide lists barriers to communication that are largely verbal. These barriers to communication are avoidable. However, once barriers to communication have surfaced, a significant amount of work may be necessary to overcome them.
Effective Feedback

Role Play: Providing Feedback

Brainstorm: Feedback

What is feedback?

What is its purpose?
Feedback

What:
- Comments in the form of opinions about or reactions to something

Why:
- To initiate and improve communication
- To evaluate or modify a process or product
- To enable improvements to be made
- To provide useful information for future decisions and development

Feedback and Clinical Mentoring

- Feedback is a vital aspect of the mentor-mentee relationship.
- If the mentor is unable to give feedback effectively, and/or the mentee is unable to receive constructive feedback...
  ...not much will be accomplished!

Small Group Discussion:
Feedback and Clinical Mentoring

What unique factors about the health care setting need to be considered by the mentor when giving feedback to the mentee?

• Note that feedback can be positive or critical, but the sole purpose is to improve performance, not punish poor performance
Two Approaches to Feedback

On the following slides, a scenario related to provider-initiated testing and counseling (PITC) will be presented, followed by role plays demonstrating two different approaches to giving feedback to the health care worker.

- How we give feedback—what we say, how we say it, when we say it—is critical to whether the feedback is effective and achieves the intended effect.
Worksheet 3.1: PITC Scenario and Feedback Role Play

Instructions:
The scenario below is related to provider-initiated testing and counseling (PITC). Consider the two possible approaches to feedback that follow the scenario.

PITC scenario:
You are a clinical mentor observing a nurse during pretest counseling of a patient. During the risk assessment, the patient reports that she has a husband and two other sexual partners. She does not use condoms with her husband, but uses condoms with one of her other two partners.

The nurse asks about the three partners in a judgmental tone that results in the patient looking visibly uncomfortable in the room.

How should the clinical mentor provide feedback to the nurse after the visit?

Feedback approach #1:
Clinical mentor (with serious facial expression and harsh tone): “Did you realize that you asked about the three partners in a very judgmental way? Did you see how the patient reacted to your questions? It seems that you must have some personal issues related to sex outside of marriage! I’m worried that this patient will be afraid to return to the clinic in the future! This is not how we expect pretest counseling to be carried out… you need to do this better!”

Feedback approach #2:
Clinical mentor should use supportive nonverbal body language—a kind expression and tone of voice, etc.

“I just wanted to take a couple of minutes to talk about the last client. I really appreciate the way you engaged with the patient like you did. It was excellent that you asked about the number of partners the patient had and about condom use. A suggestion for next time would be to probe further about the condom use. For example, once the patient reported that she didn’t use condoms with her husband but uses them with one of her other partners, you could specifically ask which partner she uses condoms with—number one, number two, or number three? Ask if she uses condoms sometimes or always with that partner. Ask why she does not use condoms with number one and number two. Ask her if she thinks that she is at risk for HIV when she does not use condoms.

“It’s also extremely important to counsel patients in a manner that doesn’t make the patient uncomfortable with you. If the patient starts to feel uneasy during the visit—like you might be judging them in some way—it’s very likely that she will not disclose information regarding her HIV risk in an honest manner. So even though you may not personally agree with someone’s behavior, our role in counseling is to give the client enough information to show the client how best to keep a low risk profile for acquiring HIV. But ultimately, the patient must make the decision about what behavior she chooses to adopt.”
“Do you have questions about what I’ve just talked about? How do you think you can practice being impartial to client’s responses about their behavior in the future?”

Discussion questions:

1. What were some differences between these two scenarios?

2. What did the HCW likely learn in the first feedback approach?

3. What did the HCW likely learn in the second feedback approach?
Slide 26

PITC Scenario (1)

You are a clinical mentor observing a nurse during pretest counseling of a patient. During the risk assessment, the patient reports that she has a husband and two other sexual partners. She does not use condoms with her husband, but uses condoms with one of her other two partners.

Slide 27

PITC Scenario (2)

- The nurse asks about the three partners in a judgmental tone that results in the patient looking visibly uncomfortable in the room.
- How should the clinical mentor provide feedback to the nurse after the visit?

Slide 28

PITC Scenario (3)

Providing feedback:
Approach #1

- Clinical mentor: “Did you realize that you asked about the three partners in a very judgmental way? Did you see how the patient reacted to your questions? It seems that you must have some personal issues related to sex outside of marriage! I’m worried that this patient will be afraid to return to the clinic in the future! This is not how we expect pretest counseling to be carried out... You need to do this better!”
- Nurse (embarrassed, ashamed): I’m sorry. I didn’t know what to say. [expand on this if desired]
Clinical mentor (using supportive nonverbal body language, kind expression, etc.)

- “I just wanted to take a couple of minutes to talk about the last client. I really appreciate the way you engaged with the patient like you did. It was excellent that you asked about the number of partners the patient had and about condom use. A suggestion for next time would be to probe further about the condom use. For example, once the patient reported that she didn’t use condoms with her husband but uses them with one of her other partners, you could specifically ask which partner she uses condoms with—number one, number two, or number three? Ask if she uses condoms sometimes or always with that partner. Ask why she does not use condoms with number one and number two. Ask her if she thinks that she is at risk for HIV when she does not use condoms.”

- “It’s also extremely important to counsel patients in a manner that doesn’t make the patient uncomfortable with you. If the patient starts to feel uneasy during the visit—like you might be judging them in some way—it’s very likely that she will not disclose information regarding her HIV risk in an honest manner. So even though you may not personally agree with someone’s behavior, our role in counseling is to give the client enough information to show the client how best to keep a low risk profile for acquiring HIV. But ultimately, the patient must make the decision about what behavior she chooses to adopt.”

- “Do you have questions about what I’ve just talked about? How do you think you can practice being impartial to client’s responses about their behavior in the future?”
Group Discussion

- What were the differences between the two approaches?
- What did the health care worker learn in the 1st scenario? The 2nd?
- Other thoughts?

Remember that the purpose of feedback is not to reprimand, but to help health care workers perform better in their jobs.

Feedback: Basic Principles (1)

- Ask permission or identify that you are giving feedback.
- Examples:
  - "Can I give you some feedback on that follow-up patient visit?"
  - "I'd like to provide some feedback on what I observed during my visit today."

Handout 3.2: Basic Principles of Giving Feedback

- Ask permission or identify that you are giving feedback. Examples:
  - “Can I give you some feedback on that follow-up patient visit?”
  - “I’d like to provide some feedback on what I observed during my visit today.”

- Give feedback in a “feedback sandwich.”
  - Start with a positive observation (“It was good that you…”)
  - Provide a constructively critical observation or suggestion for improvement.
  - Finish with a second positive observation or summary statement.

- Use the first person: “I think,” “I saw,” “I noticed.”

- Describe what you observed and be specific. State facts, not opinions, interpretations, or judgments.

- Feedback should address what a person did, not your interpretation of his or her motivation or reason for it.
  - Action: “You skipped several sections of the counseling script.”
  - Interpretation: “You skipped several sections of the counseling script. I know you want to finish because it’s almost lunch time, but…”

- Don’t exaggerate. Avoid terms such as “you always” or “you never.”

- Don’t be judgmental or use labels. Avoid words like “lazy,” “careless,” or “forgetful.”

- When making suggestions for improvement, use statements like, “You may want to consider…” or “Another option is…”

- You can provide feedback any time: during the clinic visit, immediately afterwards, or after you leave the clinic premises.

- Don’t wait too long to give feedback. The closer the feedback is to the actual event, the more likely the HCW will remember the teaching point.

- Certain feedback requires more immediate timing:
  - Example: If you see that the HCW is doing something in error or omitting a very important step during the visit.

- If you provide feedback during a patient encounter:
  - Do not alarm the HCW or patient. Put them both at ease.
  - Be very calm and patient as you explain your recommendation.
Feedback: Basic Principles (2)

Give feedback in a “feedback sandwich”

1) Start with a positive observation
2) Provide a suggestion for improvement
3) Finish with a second positive observation

• The positive observations are the two pieces of bread, while the suggestion for improvement is the filling tucked in between them.

Feedback: Basic Principles (3)

- Use the first person: “I think,” “I saw,” “I noticed.”
- Describe what you observed and be specific. State facts, not opinions, interpretations, or judgments.
- Address what a person did...
  - “You skipped several sections of the counseling script.”
  - ... not your interpretation of his or her motivation or reason for it.
  - “I know you want to finish quickly because it’s almost lunchtime, but you skipped several sections…”

Feedback: Basic Principles (4)

- Don’t be judgmental or use labels:
  - Avoid words like “lazy,” “careless,” or “forgetful”
- Don’t exaggerate or generalize:
  - Avoid terms such as, “you always,” or “you never”
- When making suggestions for improvement, use statements like:
  - “You may want to consider...”
  - “Another option is to...”
Slide 35

When to Give Feedback (1)

- You can provide feedback any time:
  - During a patient encounter
  - Immediately afterward a patient encounter
  - During a review meeting at the end of the day

- **BUT** don’t wait too long to give feedback. The closer the feedback is to the actual event, the more likely the health care worker will remember the teaching point.

Slide 36

When to Give Feedback (2)

- Certain feedback requires more immediate timing:
  - Example: If you see that the health care worker is doing something in error or omitting a very important step during the visit.

- If you provide feedback during a patient encounter:
  - Do not alarm the health care worker or patient. Put them both at ease.
  - Be very calm and patient as you explain your recommendation.

Slide 37

Small Group Work

Feedback Scenarios
Worksheet 3.3: Feedback Scenarios

Instructions:

• Divide into pairs with somebody you don’t know well.
• Refer to Handout 3.2 as needed.
• One member of the pair should play the clinical mentor, the second should play a health care worker (HCW).
• Use the scenarios the facilitator assigns to you.
• Read the scenario together.
• Role play, and provide mentor feedback to the HCW based on the scenario.
• Switch roles, and repeat with the 2nd scenario.

Scenario 1

The clinical mentor observed a PITC pretest counseling visit and noticed the following about the HCW she followed:

• The HCW displayed effective interpersonal skills with the patient.
• The HCW did not reassure the patient of the confidentiality between the client and the HCW.
• The HCW did not document the counseling properly in the patient record.
• The HCW was good about encouraging the patient to return to the clinic for follow-up HIV testing in 3–6 months if her results end up being negative this visit.

Scenario 2

The clinical mentor observed a PITC posttest counseling visit for an HIV-infected patient and noticed the following about the HCW he followed:

• The HCW did not give the client sufficient time to absorb the news about the HIV diagnosis; instead, he immediately started talking about safe sex practices and the need for 100% condom use.
• At the end of the visit, the HCW told the client about services available for HIV patients, CD4 counts, clinical management and follow-up, available support groups, social welfare support, etc.
• The HCW did not cross check the client’s health passport, register and lab printout to make sure that the client ID number was consistent for all three.
Scenario 3
The clinical mentor observed an antenatal care (ANC) visit and noticed the following about the HCW she followed:

- The HCW forgot to enquire whether this patient had young children at home who might need HIV testing or to enquire whether her partner had been tested yet.
- The HCW included a thorough explanation of the benefits of PMTCT programs for HIV positive women.
- The HCW told the patient that she should avoid breast feeding and use Lactogen infant formula to feed her baby.

Scenario 4
The clinical mentor observed on the labor and delivery (L&D) ward and noticed the following about the HCW she followed:

- The HCW did not use gloves with every client; he would use gloves only for patients who he thought were HIV positive.
- The midwife indicated that she wanted to perform an episiotomy. She routinely performs an episiotomy for every primigravida that presents to the L & D.
- The HCW reported to give nevirapene (NVP) to the mother and baby at the time of delivery, however failed to note this in the patient record.
- Immediately following the delivery, the HCW helped guide the mother on how to prepare infant formula feeds for her baby since the mother had decided to formula feed prior to her delivery.

Scenario 5
The clinical mentor observed a follow-up visit at the antiretroviral therapy (ART) clinic. The patient had been on antiretroviral drugs (ARVs) for 2 months.

- The HCW asked whether the patient was taking his medications correctly, and the patient responded “yes.” The HCW didn’t ask the patient about when and how he was taking his medications.
- The HCW asked helpful follow-up questions about the patient’s reported headache and numbness/tingling in his feet.
- The HCW did not conduct a neurological examination of the patient.
- The HCW made an appropriate referral to the physician to follow up on the patient’s symptoms.
Key Points (1)

- Good communication—both verbal and nonverbal—is essential for an effective mentoring relationship.
- Communication techniques such as appropriate body language, active/reflective listening, and summarizing can aid communication.
- Feedback is integral to adult learning, and is a vital component of the clinical mentoring relationship.

Key Points (2)

- Feedback should include both positive and “how to improve” commentary; be descriptive, objective, and nonjudgmental; and focus on the individual’s actions.
- While knowledge about a subject is a prerequisite for effective teaching, learning is more often a result of how knowledge is communicated.
Session 4: Theories of Learning

Participant Handbook

Basics of Clinical Mentoring
Session 4: Theories of Learning

Time: 90 minutes (1 hour, 30 minutes)

Learning Objectives
By the end of this session, participants will be able to:
• Describe the principles of adult learning theory and the domains of learning
• Explain the application of these theories to clinical mentoring

Worksheet
• Worksheet 4.1: Domains of Learning Activity

Handout
• Handout 4.2: Domains of Learning and Learning Objective Verbs

Key Points
• Adult learning theory should guide mentor instruction.
• Adults are self-directed learners who bring experience to their learning and are motivated by tasks they find meaningful.
• All learning is added to past knowledge, which can influence how learners learn.
• Lessons should incorporate learning objectives from the appropriate level of complexity of all three domains of learning.
Session 4: Theories of Learning
Basics of Clinical Mentoring

Learning Objectives
By the end of this session, participants will be able to:

- Describe the principles of adult learning theory and the domains of learning
- Explain the application of these theories to clinical mentoring

Brainstorm: Good Teachers
- Consider the teachers you have had in your life.
- Who stands out for you as an example of a “good teacher”?
- Questions to consider:
  - What qualities did these good teachers have?
  - What did these teachers do that made them “good teachers”?
  - What didn't they do that made them such good teachers?
Principles of Adult Learning

1. Adults feel anxious if participating in a group makes them look weak, either professionally or personally.
2. Adults bring a great deal of experience and knowledge to any learning situation.
3. Adults are decision-makers and self-directed learners.
4. Adults are motivated by information or tasks that they find meaningful.
5. Adults have many responsibilities and can be impatient when they feel their time has been wasted.

1. Adults feel anxious if participating in a group makes them look weak
   - Take the time to build a relationship of trust with your mentee before asking him/her to take risks.
   - Design feedback sessions, educational exercises, and discussion sessions that help mentees feel:
     - Safe to ask questions
     - Confident that they will be respected
   - Assure mentee of the confidentiality of your relationship.

2. Adults bring a great deal of experience and knowledge to any learning situation
   - Getting to know your mentees and their experiences and knowledge can help you understand why they do the things they do.
   - Show respect for mentees' experiences by listening to their ideas and opinions.

Your mentee will often have a good reason for doing what he/she does, even if that reason is not immediately apparent to you. Try to approach situations from the perspective of understanding and learning about and from your mentee.
3. Adults are decision makers and self-directed learners

- Be the “guide on the side” rather than teaching from the podium, acting as someone who knows it all.
- Listen to what mentees want and need, and be flexible in your planning:
  - Change your approach if your agenda or methods are not working.

4. Adults are motivated by information or tasks that they find meaningful

- Conduct a **needs assessment** so that you are aware of:
  - How much mentees already know
  - What mentees want/need to learn
  - Needs related to learning styles
- Note that professional and personal needs or issues can affect participants’ attention spans:
  - May enhance or challenge a person’s ability to learn
  - What are some examples?

5. Adults have many responsibilities & can be impatient when they feel their time has been wasted

- Limit the length of your visit to what was agreed
- Learn what questions they have about the subject
- Don’t cover material they already know unless there is a good reason for review
These are two common mantras in teaching. However, the most important this is to remember that people learn differently.

- Some people will remember everything they hear.
- Others will not remember anything unless they see it.
- Sometimes people need to practice a skill before they remember it.

Try to incorporate different teaching styles to accommodate your learners.
As much as possible, try to use methods that engage different types of learners since you may not know how your mentee learns best. The more methods that you can incorporate into your teaching moments, the more likely you will cover material in a way that the learner can grasp effectively.

Key factors that lead to changes in physician behavior: 1, 2
- Instructor assessment of learning needs
- Interaction among learners with opportunities to practice the behaviors
- Sequenced and multifaceted educational activities
- In general, interactive and mixed (didactic/interactive) educational sessions have the most significant effect on professional practice.
- While these studies were conducted with physicians, one can generalize the findings to other health care workers.

Sources:

Three Basic Learning Styles

- **Visual**: Learning through watching, observing, and reading
  - Demonstrations, visual examples
- **Auditory**: Learning through listening
  - Case discussions, lectures
- **Kinesthetic**: Learning through doing, practicing, and touching
  - Role plays, practice techniques (i.e., blood draws)
Something to Consider...

“If telling were the same as teaching, we would all be so smart we could hardly stand ourselves.”

—R. Mager
It is important to realize that learning is not simply acquiring facts—learners must feel that what they are doing is important, and must have the relevant skills to provide quality health care.

According to Bloom at the University of Chicago (1956), learning can be classified into three domains, or categories: cognitive, affective, and psychomotor. Each domain has subcategories that move from simple to more complex processes.

Some people may be more familiar with the categories “knowledge,” “attitudes,” and “practice,” which are similar to Bloom’s categories, but in Bloom’s system, knowledge is a subcategory within the cognitive domain.

It is less important to know the names of the domains than it is to understand them to engage mentees in the different domains of learning, which will lead to more holistic and comprehensive training.

Learning Objectives:

- The domains of learning directly relate to defining learning objectives. It is important to cover different domains of learning in mentoring.
- When making learning objectives with mentees, make some that relate to each category.
Activity: Learning Objective Categorization

Which domain does the learning objective fit in?
Worksheet 4.1: Domains of Learning Activity

Instructions:
• Work with the person sitting next to you.
• Read the learning objectives below.
• Determine which of the three domains of learning each objective falls within. Write that domain on the line provided before each objective.
• Discuss as a large group.

Domains: Cognitive - Affective - Psychomotor

Learning Objectives
1. Identify three primary modes of HIV transmission
2. Explain the difference between HIV and AIDS
3. Use WHO clinical staging definitions to assist in clinical decision-making
4. Outline effective strategies for managing nutrition complications in HIV-infected patients
5. Design an HIV-prevention counseling program based on the MOH counseling standards and guidelines
6. Evaluate the risk faced by HCWs of contracting HIV on the job
7. Ask open-ended questions to elicit information during a counseling session
8. Present clients with risk-reduction strategies appropriate to their needs
9. Demonstrate ability to provide a client with an HIV-positive result test result in a compassionate and supportive manner
10. Integrate professional standards of patient confidentiality into personal life
11. Act objectively when solving problems
12. Observe correct technique for conducting a pelvic exam
13. Describe the steps involved in conducting a rapid HIV test
14. Draw blood using universal precautions
15. Conduct a thorough physical examination
The **cognitive domain** relates to knowledge and intellectual skills such as understanding, organizing ideas, analyzing and synthesizing information, applying knowledge, choosing among alternatives in problem solving, and evaluating ideas or actions. Subcategories in the cognitive domain move from simple to more complex cognitive processes. These levels reflect the process through which the learner moves, mastering the lower-level subcategories necessary to proceeding to the next level.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COGNITIVE DOMAIN</th>
<th>ACTION VERBS for OBJECTIVES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Knowledge:</strong> recall; the ability to remember information</td>
<td>Describe, define, identify, list, name, recognize, reproduce, state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comprehension:</strong> understanding; the ability to interpret and explain information</td>
<td>Articulate, distinguish, estimate, explain, generalize, infer, interpret, paraphrase, rewrite, summarize, translate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Application:</strong> the ability to use information in a new situation, to use knowledge and skills acquired in the classroom to solve problems and create new approaches</td>
<td>Apply, change, construct, demonstrate, modify, operate, predict, prepare, produce, show, solve, use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Analysis:</strong> the ability to break down information to understand its structure, to categorize, and to recognize patterns</td>
<td>Analyze, categorize, compare, contrast, differentiate, identify, illustrate, infer, outline, relate, select, separate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Synthesis:</strong> the ability to bring together sets of information to create or invent solutions to problems, illustrate relationships between parts of a whole</td>
<td>Compile, create, design, diagnose, diagram, discriminate, explain, generate, modify, organize, plan, relate, reorganize, separate, summarize, write</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Evaluation:</strong> the ability to make a judgment based upon evidence</td>
<td>Appraise, assess, compare, conclude, contrast, criticize, critique, describe, evaluate, explain, interpret, justify, summarize, support</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The **affective domain** relates to the emotional component of learning, and is concerned with changes or growth in interest, attitudes, and values. It emphasizes feeling, tone, emotion, or degree of acceptance or rejection. Subcategories move from more simple affective components—such as receiving and responding to new information—to more complex ones—such as organizing and internalizing values. The affective domain is important to address when training health care providers, as the providers’ values, emotions, attitudes, and beliefs can have a great impact on the type of care provided.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AFFECTIVE DOMAIN</th>
<th>ACTION VERBS for OBJECTIVES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Receiving (willing to listen):</strong> awareness, attention to new information</td>
<td>Ask, choose, describe, give, identify, locate, select</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Responding (willing to participate):</strong> active pursuit of an interest, willingness to respond, motivation</td>
<td>Answer, assist, discuss, greet, help, participate, present, read, report, select, tell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Valuing (willing to be involved):</strong> the worth or value a person attaches to a particular object, situation, or behavior; reflects internalization of a set of values</td>
<td>Complete, demonstrate, differentiate, explain, follow, initiate, join, justify, propose, read, share</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organization (willing to be an advocate):</strong> the ability to prioritize and organize values</td>
<td>Adhere, alter, arrange, combine, compare, defend, explain, integrate, modify</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Internalizing values (willing to change one’s behavior):</strong> the ability to act consistently and predictably according to a value system or consistent philosophy</td>
<td>Act, display, influence, listen, modify, perform, propose, question, serve, solve, verify</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The **psychomotor domain** relates to the physical skills and/or the performance of motor tasks according to a standard of accuracy, rapidity, or smoothness. Subcategories progress from observation then performance of a procedure, to mastery of a physical skill. Learning is demonstrated by the learner performing the skill to a designated standard or level of proficiency.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PSYCHOMOTOR DOMAIN</th>
<th>ACTION VERBS for OBJECTIVES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Perception:</strong> observation of behaviors involved in completing a task</td>
<td>Observe, attend to, ask, describe, participate, answer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Set:</strong> becoming mentally prepared to perform the task</td>
<td>Question, explore, consider outcomes, participate, tell, give examples, express confidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Guided formatting:</strong> the early stage in learning a complex skill that includes imitation, performing a task with assistance, and trial and error; adequacy of performance is achieved by practicing</td>
<td>Complete, demonstrate, replicate, share, point out, break down, put together</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mechanism:</strong> the intermediate stage in learning a complex skill; learned responses have become habitual and the movements can be performed with some confidence and proficiency (acting without assistance)</td>
<td>Arrange, choose, conduct, construct, design, integrate, organize, perform, modify, refine, respond, vary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Complex overt response:</strong> performing automatically with facility and habitually; fine tuning and perfection of the skill or technique</td>
<td>Arrange, choose, conduct, construct, design, integrate, organize, perform, modify, refine</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
New Research

- **Preconception:** People acquire new information on top of preexisting knowledge, which is a powerful influence.
- **Knowledge:** Acquiring a body of knowledge is critical for creating understanding, and for high levels of cognitive functioning.
- **Metacognition:** Experts differ from novices in specific cognitive ways—they monitor when they need more information, judge whether new information seems consistent with existing knowledge, and ask what analogies they can use to advance their own understanding.

These concepts will be elaborated in the next few slides.


---

New Research: Preconception

- If knowledge is incorrect or underdeveloped, people may not learn or may learn only to test.
- All new learning involves transfer from previous learning.
- Implications?

---

- Three key findings on how people learn have recently emerged from the literature.
- In combination with earlier research and validated practices in education, these findings have important implications for how we approach mentoring. This research provides additional evidence to support the value of needs assessment, adult learning principles.

---

- People have preconceptions about how the world works.
- These initial understandings can have a powerful effect on the integration of new concepts and information. So people learn on top of what they already know. Adult learning theory says adults bring their experience to a learning situation. Examples:
  - Thinking the world is flat and envisioning the world as a round pancake.
  - Thinking 1/8 is larger than 1/4 because 8 is a larger number than 4.
  - Getting a person’s name wrong the first time you are introduced and then finding it difficult to remember once corrected.
  - Not understanding/believing germ theory.
  - People don’t know what they don’t know.
  - Primacy: the strength of early memories for an elderly person who has forgotten more recent events.
  - Need to draw out and work with existing understandings.
New Research: Knowledge

- Ability to integrate new information into existing body of knowledge is the most important factor for assuring transfer of learning from classroom to application in the real world.

- Experts are better able to see patterns, relationships, and discrepancies where the novice sees unrelated pieces of information.

- Research has shown key differences between experts and novices in how they organize information.

- To develop competencies, learners must: a) have a deep foundation of factual knowledge; b) understand facts and ideas in the context of a conceptual framework; and c) organize knowledge in ways that facilitate retrieval and application.

- Integrating new information into an existing body of knowledge is the most important factor for assuring transfer of learning from classroom to application in the real world.
  - Map with and without border—expert would differ from a novice by knowing where borders might be located because of his/her preexisting knowledge of physical, economic, and political geography (e.g., borders often follow mountain ranges and rivers; main cities are often situated at key transportation sites).

- This finding aligns with the cascade of learning possible in the cognitive domain:
  - knowledge (memorization);
  - understanding (being able to paraphrase);
  - application (solving a problem with new information);
  - analysis (comparing and contrasting ideas);
  - synthesis (modifying or designing a system); and
  - evaluation (defending an idea or opinion).

- Classroom training is important in establishing a body of knowledge upon which to build

- Implications:
  - If experts are better able to see patterns, relationships, and discrepancies, they may need to help novices make patterns out of the unrelated information they are interpreting.

Implications?
Evidence shows that experts and novices differ in significant ways. Experts monitor when they need more information, judge whether new information seems consistent with existing knowledge, and ask what analogies they can use to advance their own understanding. They question themselves and where they got the information.

- Metacognition can be taught. It often takes the form of an internal dialogue.
- Mentees can be led toward self-reflection, self-assessment, and sense-making.
- Asking mentees to:
  - Predict outcomes
  - Explain one’s decision-making process in making a diagnosis
  - Note failure to comprehend
  - Plan ahead
  - Reciprocal teaching in reading
- Implication in clinical training: Mentor should assess mentee’s decision-making process, assumptions, biases that affect clinical judgment. The bedside teaching approach is a good example of how/where to do this.

**Implications for Educators**

- Range and type of learning objectives
- Innovative learning methods for multiple domains
- Needs assessment
- Place information into conceptual frameworks
- Provide many examples
- Emphasize metacognition
- What else?
Key Points

- Adult learning theory should guide mentor instruction.
- Adults are self-directed learners who bring experience to their learning and are motivated by tasks they find meaningful.
- All learning is added to past knowledge, which can influence how learners learn.
- Lessons should incorporate learning objectives from the appropriate level of complexity of all three domains of learning.
Session 5: Clinical Teaching Skills

Participant Handbook

Basics of Clinical Mentoring
Session 5: Clinical Teaching Skills

Time: 75 minutes (1 hour, 15 minutes)

Learning Objectives
By the end of this session, participants will be able to:

- Define a teaching moment
- Use bedside teaching, side-by-side teaching, and case presentations as teaching strategies

Handouts

- Handout 5.1: Five Steps of Bedside Teaching
- Handout 5.2: Demonstration of Bedside Teaching Approach
- Handout 5.3: A Patient-Centered Approach to Bedside Teaching
- Handout 5.4: Six Steps for Creating an Effective Case Study

Key Points

- Teaching moments are opportunities to improve clinical skills of a health care worker, can take place in a variety of settings, and mentors should maximize the number of teaching moments at a site visit.

- Bedside and side-by-side teaching reinforce classroom learning, and allow the mentor to model clinical technique, as well as attitudes and behaviors.

- Case studies are an effective tool for clinical teaching.
Teaching moments may involve reminding the health care worker about important side effects to monitor with antiretroviral therapy (ART); it might involve reviewing effective communication skills in a counseling session; or it might involve supporting and motivating the health care worker to build his/her confidence.
Unfortunately, there are times when mentors don’t allow staff to take full advantage of their presence in the clinic.

One way to identify opportunities for teaching moments is to think of where and when they might occur:

• Can be done while a patient is in the room
• Can be done after a patient visit, e.g., in the hallway while waiting for the next patient, or when you’re both on a tea break
• Can be planned for in the future, e.g., identify a learning need and schedule a date to give a lecture or lunchtime informational session
Content of a Teaching Moment

Can be about any aspect of service provision within the clinical setting:
- Methodology or process of a counseling session or procedure
- Background on disease pathophysiology
- Patient rapport/interpersonal communication patterns
- Building confidence
- Strategies for maintaining patient confidentiality within the clinic setting
- Suggesting appropriate treatment options

Three Basic Learning Styles

- **Visual**: Learning through watching, observing, and reading
  - Demonstrations, visual examples
- **Auditory**: Learning through listening
  - Case discussions, lectures
- **Kinesthetic**: Learning through doing, practicing, and touching
  - Role plays, practice techniques (e.g., blood draws)

This slide should be familiar from the last session, but is presented here again as a reminder.

- Once you’ve identified a teaching moment and know what you would like to convey to the health care worker, you should think of how you will teach. Each learning style has associated teaching methods.
- As much as possible, teach in ways that engage multiple learning styles at any given time. The more methods you can incorporate into your teaching moments, the more likely it is you will cover material in a way that the mentee can grasp effectively.
Mentors should not only be teachers, but should “talk the talk and walk the walk” — that is, they should lead by example when interacting with and teaching mentees. The following two slides give specific techniques for teaching mentees effectively.

Think aloud: A mentor should make his/her own clinical reasoning transparent. This might involve:
- Explaining the thought process that leads to a diagnosis.
- Verbalizing the treatment options for a challenging case.
- Explaining why a particular course of action is chosen.

Activate the mentee:
- Mentors must encourage mentees to be motivated to connect their needs with patients’ needs.
- Therefore, an adaptable, collaborative approach to clinical teaching is most effective — mentor must know when to stand back or jump in, while still giving enough freedom to the mentee to grow without hurting themselves or patients.

Listen smart:
- It is important for the mentor to efficiently assess the mentee’s acquisition, synthesis, and presentation of clinical data, even if the mentor does not have previous knowledge about the patient.

**Teaching Techniques: WALK**

- Work as a hands-on role model
  - Model the physical experience of treating patients
- Adapt to uncertainty
  - Embrace it as a valuable learning opportunity
- Link learning to caring
  - Demonstrate responsibility and empathy for each patient, and expect mentees to do the same
- Kindle kindness
  - Establish generosity as the standard for each clinical interaction

**Patient-Centered Teaching**

Patient-centered teaching = Teaching what needs to be taught, for sake of patient

**vs.**

Teacher-centered teaching = Teaching what one knows, even if it does not address the patient's problems

- Treating the disease vs. treating the illness—effective teachers do not prioritize disease (what the patient has), but instead illness (what the patient feels)

Mentoring Strategies

- Bedside teaching
- Side-by-side mentoring
- Case Presentations

While bedside teaching implies an inpatient setting, it can easily be adapted for use in a clinic/outpatient setting.

Bedside teaching is an important part of the process of adult learning, as it reinforces classroom learning.

Strengths and weaknesses of mentees become clear at the bedside, because mentors can watch mentees interact with patients. Mentors can experience what mentees do and how they act with patients firsthand, in a way that cannot happen outside of a patient encounter.

*Source: http://www.oucom.ohiou.edu/fd/mo nographs/bedside.htm
**Bedside Teaching (2)**

**Before meeting with the patient:**

Mentor and mentee should discuss the purpose and structure of the session:

- Identify appropriate patients
- Set goals for the session
- Agree on roles and expectations
- Discuss expected time frame

- Identify appropriate patients: Appropriate patients will be capable of interacting with mentor and mentee, or will have family members present that can interact with them (if possible).
  - It is often helpful to arrange session with patient ahead of time.
- Set goals: What does the mentee wish to learn or practice?
- Agree on roles and expectations: Who will make introductions? Who will take the lead on each aspect of the visit?
- Time frame: This is especially important if there is a tight schedule, or mentor and mentee are seeing multiple patients.
See Handout 5.1 and review it as a large group.

Before going through the five steps, the patient should be oriented to everyone in the room and explained the purpose of the session. The mentee should then present the case, without reading from the chart and without interruption from the mentor.

Following that, the five steps of clinical teaching should be employed:

- **Get a commitment.** The mentor asks the mentee to articulate their diagnosis or plan for treatment based upon the patient history and symptoms they have just identified. Asking the mentee to commit to a diagnosis or plan will increase the impact of the teaching session by providing a solid point from which to work.

- **Probe for supporting evidence.** Ask the mentee to explain how they reached their conclusion. Listening to their reasoning will help you respond appropriately to their knowledge level.

- **Reinforce what was done well.** Offer specific feedback rather than a general statement such as, “Good diagnosis.” Giving specific comments will provide the mentee with tools to use in similar situations in the future.

- **Give guidance for errors and omissions.** As when offering positive feedback, any corrections should be specific. Care should also be taken to make sure the feedback is constructive and includes specific plans for improvement.

- **Summarize the encounter with a general principle.** Choose one or two general principles that arose from this encounter to become the “take-home message.” Summarizing the encounter in this way will help the mentee apply the lessons learned to other situations.

- These steps can be performed in order, or mixed and matched according to the situation.
Handout 5.1: Five Steps of Bedside Teaching

Step One: Get a Commitment
This pushes the mentee to move beyond his/her level of comfort and makes the teaching encounter more active and more personal. It also shows respect for the learner and fosters an adult learning style. A main goal of getting the learner to commit is to reveal their reasoning, not just to get more information about the case.

Questions to ask:
- “What other diagnoses would you consider in this setting?”
- “What laboratory tests do you think we should get?”
- “How do you think we should treat this patient?”
- “Do you think this patient needs to be hospitalized?”
- “Based on the history you obtained, what parts of the physical should we focus on?”

Step Two: Probe for Supporting Evidence
It is important to determine that there is an adequate basis for the answer, and to encourage an appropriate reasoning process. Instead of giving a right or wrong response to the commitment the learner has made, ask more questions:

- “What factors in the history and physical support your diagnosis?”
- “Why would you choose that particular medication?”
- “Why do you feel this patient should be hospitalized?”
- “Why do you feel it is important to do that part of the physical in this situation?”

Step Three: Reinforce What Was Done Well
The simple statement, “That was a good presentation,” is not sufficient. Comments should include specific behaviors that demonstrated knowledge, skills, or attitudes valued by the mentor.

- Your diagnosis of “probable pneumonia” was well supported by your history and physical. You clearly integrated the patient’s history and your physical findings in making that assessment.”

- “Your presentation was well-organized. You had the chief complaint followed by a detailed history of present illness. You included appropriate additional medical history and medications and finished with a focused physical exam.”
Step Four: Give Guidance about Errors and Omissions

The main idea here is to identify an opportunity for behavior change and provide an alternative strategy. Instead of using extreme terms such as “bad” or “poor,” expressions such as “not best” or “it is preferred” may carry less of a negative value judgment while getting the point across. Comments should also be as specific as possible to the situation, identifying specific behaviors that could be improved upon in the future.

- “In your presentation, you mentioned a temperature in your history but did not tell me the vital signs when you began your physical exam. Following standard patterns in your presentations and notes will help avoid omissions and will improve your communication of medical information.”

- “I agree, at some point, complete pulmonary function testing may be helpful, but right now the patient is acutely ill. The results may not reflect her baseline and may be very difficult for her. We could glean some important information with just a peak flow and a pulse oximeter.”

Step Five: Teach a General Principle

One of the more challenging—but essential—tasks of this model is for the learner to take information and accurately generalize it to other situations. The teaching principle does not need to be a medical fact, but can be about strategies or procedures. While there is generally not time to have a major teaching session, one or two statements can make a big impact.

- “Deciding whether someone needs to be treated in the hospital for pneumonia is challenging. Fortunately there are some criteria that have been tested which help.”

- “In looking for information on what antibiotics to choose for a disease. I have found it more useful to use an up-to-date handbook than a textbook, which may be several years out of date.”

Step Six: Conclusion

Time management in clinical teaching is essential. The conclusion defines the end of the teaching interaction and the role of the learner in the next events.
Demonstration: 
Bedside Teaching Approach

See Handout 5.2 for the script.
Ask for two volunteers to be the mentor and the mentee.
Ask the volunteers to present the scene in front of the group.
Debrief the demonstration by discussing:
• What did you think about this approach?
• Is this an approach you could adopt in your mentoring?
• Other reactions?
Handout 5.2: Demonstration of Bedside Teaching Approach

Let us look at a sample presentation in order to help illustrate the steps of the bedside teaching model and their application in a practical setting.

Mentoring scenario:

You have recently started to work with a physician mentee in an ART clinic. The mentee has just finished seeing a patient and is presenting to you in an empty exam room while the patient waits in a different exam room.

Mentee: “I just saw Mary Shilonga who is a 27-year-old woman who came in today with a complaint of cough and shortness of breath. This is her initial visit to this facility. She was diagnosed as HIV-positive 3 weeks ago at the health center near her village. A CD4 test was done at the clinic and came back as 48 cells/mL.

“She reports feeling ‘tired and unwell on and off for several months’ now. Mary reports losing at least 5–10 kilos over the past 6 months. She was feeling a little better last month. But 3 weeks ago, she thought she was coming down with a cold and then developed her current symptoms of cough and shortness of breath.

“Over the past 3 weeks, she reports feeling chills, and thinks she has been having fevers on and off. She experiences shortness of breath when she tries to do activities around the house like cooking or cleaning or when she has to walk to the store to do shopping. She has not had any associated chest pain, except when she coughs. She has trouble sleeping at night sometimes due to the cough.

“Mary has three children that live at home with her; she became tearful when she started talking about her family. Her husband left the house 2 weeks ago when he found out that she was HIV-positive.

“Mary is currently not taking any prescription medications for her symptoms or any other chronic conditions. She said that her local traditional healer advised that she drink a specific herbal tea to help with her symptoms. As far as the patient can recall, she has no allergies to medications. She denies use of alcohol or drugs.

“I noted on physical exam that Mary is a thin, uncomfortable-appearing woman who is without respiratory distress at rest. Her temperature is 38.5°C, blood pressure 110/60, heart rate 88, and respiratory rate 18. Her HEENT exam is within normal limits; no sign of oral thrush/lesions/ulcers. Her neck is supple; no signs of generalized lymphadenopathy. Her lung exam reveals faint scattered bilateral crackles. She has no nasal flaring, wheezes, or intercostal retractions. Her neurological, cardiovascular, and abdominal exams are normal. Skin exam is notable for excoriated nodules scattered over arms, legs, and trunk.”

The mentee pauses here and waits for your response.
Step One: Get a Commitment

Questions that you pose as the mentor:

Your questions: “Based on this information, what would be your priority tasks to follow-up with this patient today?”

Mentee’s reply: “I am mostly concerned that Mary might have a respiratory infection and that I will need to start ART for her today.”

Your reply: “Okay, what specific infections are you worried about at this juncture?”

Mentee’s reply: “Mary could potentially have an opportunistic infection [OIs], such as PCP, pulmonary TB or bacterial pneumonia.”

Step Two: Probe for Supporting Evidence

Your reply: “What elements of your history and physical support these differential diagnoses?”

Mentee: “I am suspicious of PCP pneumonia/TB/bacterial pneumonia because of her history of fever, cough, and progressive shortness of breath, especially given her low CD4 count. Also, she is febrile today and had scattered crackles throughout her lung fields.

Step Three: Reinforce What Was Done Well

Your feedback: “Good job. You gave a thorough presentation of this patient visit. I am glad that you are prioritizing Mary’s risks for acquiring OIs given her immune status. The potential diagnoses that you gave were absolutely appropriate. We will definitely want to start talking about ART with Mary. However, we’ll see if we can get this current infection treated first.”

Step Four: Give Guidance about Errors and Omissions

Your feedback: “One thing that might help us with narrowing Mary’s diagnosis is to obtain more information about her cough. You did not mention whether or not Mary has any sputum associated with her cough. Make sure you always note whether patients are expectorating sputum when patients present with the symptom of a cough. So you’ll want to enquire about whether Mary has had any blood-tinged or other colored-sputum. Also, it is important to enquire if she’s had a history of TB, or if anyone in her family has had a recent history of TB, especially given her HIV status.”

Step Five: Teach a General Principle

Your input: “Remember, that in general, opportunistic infections need to be treated or stabilized before starting HIV patients on ART. This helps to avoid dangerous drug-drug interactions between OI treatment regimens and ART regimens. This also helps to prevent patients from being overwhelmed with taking too many medications at once. Adherence to ART by itself is challenging enough.”
Step Six: Conclusion

Your input: “Let’s go back in the room and talk with Mary. You can enquire about the history questions I mentioned. And then we can talk about running additional tests to help determine Mary’s condition and discuss her treatment options for today. Since she was diagnosed with HIV so recently let’s also make sure we spend time answering questions that she may have regarding her condition.”
Bedside Teaching (5)

After consultation:
- Review and summarize key points.
- Solicit questions from mentee, and discuss any identified problems.
- Offer specific positive and constructive feedback.
- Agree on an area of improvement and formulate a plan for how to improve.

- After the patient encounter, there should be a debrief session and time for questions and future planning, if possible.
- Refer to Handout 5.3 for more information on the patient-centered approach to bedside teaching.
## Handout 5.3: A Patient-Centered Approach to Bedside Teaching

Adapted from: Linda M. Roth, Ph.D., David L. Gaspar, M.D., John Porcelli, Ph.D., Department of Family Medicine, Wayne State University

### DIAGNOSE PATIENT AND LEARNER

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Cue</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Do</th>
<th>Don’t</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Get a commitment.</td>
<td>Gives learner responsibility for patient care. Encourages information processing within learner’s database.</td>
<td>Learner presents case, then stops.</td>
<td>Ask what the learner thinks: “What do you think is going on?” “What would you like to do next?”</td>
<td>Do determine how the learner sees the case. (Allows learner to create his/her own formulation of the problem.)</td>
<td>Don’t ask for more data about the patient. Don’t provide an answer to the problem.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Probe for supporting evidence.</td>
<td>Allows preceptor to diagnose learner.</td>
<td>Learner commits to stance; looks to preceptor for confirmation.</td>
<td>Probe learner’s thinking: “What led you to that conclusion?” “What else may be happening here?” “What would you like to do next?”</td>
<td>Do diagnose learner’s understanding of the case – gaps and misconceptions, poor reasoning or attitudes.</td>
<td>Don’t ask for textbook knowledge.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TEACH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Cue</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Do</th>
<th>Don’t</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Choose a single, relevant teaching point.</td>
<td>Focus on specific competencies relevant to this learner working with this patient.</td>
<td>Case decision-making complete or consultation with patient needed.</td>
<td>Provide instruction. The learner (under direction or observation) or preceptor (acting as role model) collects additional information as needed.</td>
<td>Do check for learner agreement with the teaching point.</td>
<td>Don’t choose too much to cover.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Teach (or reinforce) a general rule.</td>
<td>Remediate any gaps or mistakes in data, knowledge, or missed connections.</td>
<td>Apparent gaps or mistakes in learner thinking.</td>
<td>Draw or elicit generalizations. “Let’s list the key features of this problem.” “A way of dealing with this problem is…”</td>
<td>Do help the learner generalize from this case to other cases.</td>
<td>Don’t slip into anecdotes, idiosyncratic preferences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Reinforce what was done right.</td>
<td>Firmly establish and reinforce knowledge. Reinforce behaviors beneficial to patient, colleague, or clinic.</td>
<td>Teaching point has been delivered.</td>
<td>Provide reinforcement. “Specifically, you did a good job of…, and here’s why it is important…”</td>
<td>Do state specifically what was done well and why that is important.</td>
<td>Don’t give general praise, “that was good,” because the key to effective feedback is specificity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Correct errors.</td>
<td>Teach learner how to correct the learning problem and avoid making the mistake in the future.</td>
<td>Teaching point has been delivered.</td>
<td>Endure correct knowledge has been gained. “What would you do differently to improve your encounter next time?”</td>
<td>Do make recommendations for improving future performance.</td>
<td>Don’t avoid confrontation – errors uncorrected will be repeated.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### ONE-MINUTE REFLECTION

Ask: “What did I learn about this learner?” “What did I learn about my teaching?” “How would I perform differently in the future?”

Slide 18

Side-by-Side Teaching

- As the name implies, this technique involves working alongside the mentee in clinic.
- Mentor and mentee alternate duties of seeing and examining the patients, writing relevant information in patient’s health record and ART file, and checking lab results.

Slide 19

Side-by-Side Teaching: Benefits

- Mentor can observe mentee at work and identify and address challenges
- Mentor acts as a role model when he/she is performing physical exam
- Patients are seen more quickly than if the mentee sees the patients alone
- Visits are more comprehensive and thorough
- Mentors do not feel like they are being watched, but rather supported by a colleague

Slide 20

“Example is not the main thing influencing others. It is the only thing.”

- Albert Schweitzer

This quote highlights the importance of teaching by modeling. Mentors must model good practices in order for mentees to learn them.
### Slide 21: Case Studies: Defined

- A training methodology that provides learners with an opportunity to apply new skills and knowledge to a simulated “real-life” situation.
- Allows exploration of various strategies to address complex issues.
- Requires learners to analyze the scenario, problem solve, and apply what they know to work through the case, much like they would in a clinic setting.

- In the case study method, a scenario is presented to learners followed by discussion questions about how to characterize, describe, and/or act on the situation in the scenario.
- The case study methodology thus enables the learner to develop analytic, problem-solving, and critical thinking skills in order to synthesize relevant information and make decisions.

### Slide 22: Case Studies: Rationale

- Case studies are one of the most effective ways to train health care workers in the delivery of ART, particularly in multidisciplinary teams.
- Case studies can be used to role play best practices and effective health care worker behaviors.
- Effective case studies include adequate patient detail and specific decision points.
- Discussion of options is central to case studies.

Case presentations are a good strategy to supplement bedside and side-by-side teaching. They are an effective way to engage all of the staff in a learning process, and they can be used to promote learning at more complex levels in both the cognitive and affective domains.

**Cognitive:**
- Case studies can help to develop higher-level cognitive processes such as comprehension, analysis, application, and evaluation.
- The process requires learners to go beyond remembering facts and theories, and apply newly acquired knowledge and skills to multifaceted, complex, “real-life” examples.

**Affective:**
- Includes questions that promote reflection on personal values, attitudes, and emotions.
- Case studies can be developed that spark discussion on controversial societal or clinical issues or to foster reflection on values, attitudes, and emotions amongst learners.
Case Presentations (1)

- Invite a staff member to present a difficult or challenging case they have encountered. Presentation should include the following:
  - Issue patient presented with
  - Age, gender, relevant social history
  - Medical history
  - Current profile: risk, symptoms, medications, HIV status, etc.
  - What they did in the situation

Case Presentations (2)

- Thank the staff person. Discuss the case:
  - What was good about the way the case was handled?
  - What recommendations would improve management of the case?
  - Provide your own feedback/observations on the case.

- Case presentations can be used at staff meetings, grand rounds, multidisciplinary team meetings, or in training sessions.
- The case that is presented should be a case from the facility, which makes it a realistic and relevant case to the staff.
- Ensure that confidentiality is maintained.
- Case presentations provide an opportunity for health care workers to practice giving succinct summaries of patients, a skill required in the bedside teaching approach.
- Case presentations also allow health care workers to learn from how their colleagues treated patients.

Refer to Handout 5.4 as a reference for developing case studies.
Handout 5.4: Six Steps for Creating an Effective Case Study

**Date:** 2003

**Editors:** Ann Downer, MS, EdD and Sue Swindells, MBBS

**Source:** Developing Clinical Case Studies: A Guide for Teaching
AETC National Resource Center and International AIDS Society-USA

This guide was prepared for the AETC National Resource Center by the International AIDS Society-USA with funding from the U.S. Health Resources Services Administration (HRSA). Copyright International AIDS Society-USA, 2003.

**Steps:**

Step 1. Identify the Learners and Write Educational Objectives
Step 2. Describe the Patient and Develop Sufficient Case Detail
Step 3. Focus the Learner on Discrete Clinical Decision Points
Step 4. Present Viable Options at Decision Points
Step 5. Analyze Options and Select One Course of Action
Step 6. Introduce New Information and Continue to Next Clinical Decision Point
Step 1. Identify the Learners and Write Educational Objectives

The development of effective educational material begins with consideration of the learner and his or her learning needs. Needs assessment identifies specific issues that may be challenging, confusing, or controversial to learners. See Table 1 for tips on assessing learners in advance of the teaching session or on-the-spot. If an opportunity does exist to assess learners in advance, it can be accomplished with a short questionnaire, email correspondence, or brief interviews with those planning to participate in the educational activity.

Table 1. Needs Assessment: Learn More about Your Audience

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>During the planning phase:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Send an email query to those likely to attend a session (ask two–three key questions)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Have a 10-minute phone call with several probable attendees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Have a discussion with a key informant about the group’s general characteristics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Write a formal, short needs-assessment questionnaire</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>On the spot:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>As the presentation begins, ask a few key questions; use a show of hands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What is your educational training (MD, RN, NP, PA, etc.)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How many years have you been an HIV-care practitioner?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What percent of your caseload is HIV-related?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Do you work with patients with HIV infection and substance abuse? Injection drug use?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The focus of the case will depend on learners and on the specific skills relevant to their medical practices. For example, say a patient with active substance abuse problems is admitted to the hospital through the emergency department with a diagnosis of PCP. The first clinical decision point the learner is asked to make concerns the discharge plan. The elements of the discharge plan of greatest concern to social workers are different from those of concern to an audience of HIV physicians. The focus of the scenario, therefore, depends on the needs and interests of the learners.

The actual design of a case begins with the creation of specific learning objectives once the learners and topic are defined. It is often more difficult to design objectives to fit an existing patient case scenario than to start with learning objectives and build a new case around them. The specific objectives of the case should be identified even if the case is not part of an activity that carries CME credit (which requires the publication of objectives).
Learning objectives are words, pictures or diagrams that tell others what you intend for your students to learn. The purpose of writing strong learning objectives is to make explicit the expected outcomes of a learning event and to establish accountability between the instructor and learner. Specific measurable objectives are essential for determining outcomes in the activity evaluation. Table 2 describes the elements of strong objectives and Table 3 provides a detailed taxonomy for learning objectives.

### Table 2. Writing Strong Objectives

- **Strong objectives are specific.** They are constructed by stating a performance that describes specific knowledge, attitudes, or skills that a student should be able to demonstrate following exposure to a learning activity. They do not describe the teaching strategy used to achieve a learning outcome.

- **Strong objectives are measurable.** They use active verbs that can be measured by test items, observation, problem-solving exercises, or other evaluation methods. If the performance behavior is covert (will recognize, will identify), then an indicator behavior (will recognize by circling, will identify by underlining) should be stated. See Table 3 for a list of measurable verbs for assessing achievement.

- **Strong objectives are achievable and realistic.** They describe expectations of knowledge, attitude, or behavior change that are realistic given the conditions for instruction (ie, time and size of the group).

Adapted from Mager

A case study should have more than one objective. Often a series of objectives are addressed as the case unfolds. The clinical decision points of the case focus on the issues identified in the objectives. The case study included in this guide was designed to address the issue of HIV treatment for patients with drug addiction. The specific educational objectives are listed in Slide 1.

### Case Study Objectives: Darrel

At the conclusion of this case study, learners will be better able to:

- Predict challenges to HIV care and treatment adherence in patients with substance abuse
- Design a care plan that offers treatment and support for patients with comorbidities (OI, substance abuse, and HIV)
Step 2. Describe the Patient and Develop Sufficient Case Detail

The first part of a case description provides baseline information on the patient and moves the learner toward the first clinical decision point. Key baseline information may include age, sex, HIV infection status, reported symptoms at presentation, recent medical history, relevant social history, findings from physical examination, results of laboratory studies, and findings of diagnostic workup.

The number of elements included in the case description depends on the complexity of the case and the information needed to stage the decision point.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tip Box 2. Tips for Creating Effective Slides</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Give each slide a title. Titles help the audience quickly understand the main theme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Use as few words as possible to convey your point; help the audience focus on key points.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Make your text large. Use titles with a minimum 36-point type size and text with a minimum 24-point type size. Do not use a slide that the audience cannot read.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Use no more than eight words per line of text and no more than six lines of text on each slide.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Minimize detail on tables and figures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Choose strong color contrast between the background and the text. Use light background color for a poorly lit room and dark background for a brightly lit room.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Text drop shadows should be black or a darker shade of the background color.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In general, the information should be as brief as possible while providing enough detail for the learner to make an informed clinical decision. Slides 2 and 3 describe a patient’s substance dependence, HIV status, and PCP treatment in brief but sufficient detail. The information provided is minimal but varied enough to support discussion of a number of common clinical issues, such as adherence to antiretroviral therapy in active substance users and potential drug-drug interactions between heroin or methadone and antiretroviral drugs.
It is important to provide enough information for the learners to make a decision. The patient description shown in Slide 4, if used alone, would not be sufficient to support a clinical decision point. Key information is missing, such as CD4+ cell count and viral load data, as well as any substance abuse or other health issues.
Insufficient Detail for Case Description

- A 40-year-old HIV-infected man admitted to the hospital with PCP
- Presumptive HIV infection confirmed
- Patient does well on treatment for PCP and is scheduled for discharge
Step 3. Focus the Learner on Discrete Clinical Decision Points

Once the baseline information has been presented, the case study moves toward a clinical decision point. The purpose of the decision point is to focus learners’ attention on discrete opportunities for informed decision making. It is important to develop a well-defined question that addresses an educational objective. In the case example, Darrel is being discharged from the hospital after treatment for PCP, and the learner is asked to select a recommended discharge plan (see Slide 5). The learning objective for this clinical decision point anticipates that the learner will be able to “design a care plan that offers treatment and support for patients with comorbidities (opportunistic infections, substance abuse, HIV)”.

Clinical Decision Point 1: Darrel
Which discharge plan would you choose?

1. Begin ART and PCP prophylaxis; refer to primary care clinic
2. Refer to methadone program; continue PCP treatment; begin ART; follow-up in 1 mo
3. Schedule appts for methadone program, social work assessment, and HIV clinic ASAP
4. Begin PCP prophylaxis; defer ART; and refer to a Narcotics Anonymous program
If an additional educational objective had specified that the learner will be able to “select an initial antiretroviral regimen for a patient with substance dependence,” then the clinical decision point could be redirected (see Slide 6). In this slightly different patient description, a stable living situation and drug treatment have been arranged, and the elements of the clinical decision change. Instead of focusing the decision on the types of treatment to support the patient upon discharge, the learner could choose among different antiretroviral regimens and weighs potential drug-drug interactions, adverse effects, and adherence challenges.

Different Case Description for Different Discharge Options

- Patient does well on PCP therapy; CD4+ cell count 25/μL; HIV-1 RNA level >750,000 copies/mL
- Patient is placed in residential methadone treatment program and wants to start ART
Step 4. Present Viable Options at Decision Points

It is important to present a number of relevant, mutually exclusive decision options to the learners. Each choice should be comparable to the others in terms of importance, plausibility, and level of detail. In Slide 7, for example, the options to choose from are balanced and most address the three key elements of the discharge plan: PCP treatment, follow-up HIV care, and substance abuse treatment. While there is often no “right” answer, there should be a clearly “preferred” answer.

If, as described in Slide 6, the focus of the clinical decision point had been to select among treatment regimens, the options to choose from would be a list of antiretroviral drug combinations.
It is important to create options that are grammatically similar and of roughly the same length. For example, the options are comparable in length on Slide 7. The longest option in a multiple choice set is often the preferred one because there is a natural tendency to explain and rationalize the preferred response in greater detail to the learner. This tendency is illustrated in Slide 8. It is also useful to avoid including the options “all of the above” and “none of the above” in multiple choice response sets. Instead, provide the learner with concrete, discrete choices.

### Weak Options for Discharge Plan

1. Begin ART; begin PCP prophylaxis; refer to primary care clinic
2. Refer to methadone program; continue PCP treatment; begin ART
3. Schedule an appointment for a methadone program to address the heroin addiction, an assessment from a social worker, and an appointment at an HIV clinic as soon as possible. Build a support team for the patient
4. None of the above
Step 5. Analyze Options and Select One Course of Action

In Step 5, the instructor identifies the preferred response from among the multiple choices once learners have had a chance to consider (and possibly vote on) the alternatives. At this point, the case study presentation usually includes a brief lecture segment supporting the relevant clinical issues related to the preferred response. If available, new developments and current data supporting the preferred choice are presented. The current data are discussed in the context of the patient’s situation, and the various options are contrasted and weighed.

Slides 9 and 10 illustrate two formats for presenting a preferred option. Slide 9 presents only the preferred option and provides a brief rationale for it. Slide 10 shows the preferred option highlighted to stand out among all the other options.

### Preferred Discharge Plan: Darrel

**Option:** Schedule appts for methadone program, social work assessment, and HIV clinic ASAP

**Why?**
- Drug treatment is essential first step
- Deferring ART and building team of care providers may offer best chance for success

### Options for Discharge Plan: Darrel

- Begin ART; begin PCP prophylaxis; refer to primary care clinic
- Refer to methadone program; continue PCP treatment; begin ART; follow-up in 1 mo
- Schedule appts for methadone program, social work assessment, and HIV clinic ASAP
- Begin PCP prophylaxis; defer ART; and refer to a Narcotics Anonymous program
Slides 11 and 12 list a number of factors that support the decision on how care was prioritized for this patient. The discussion could expand on any of these topics. If, as discussed above, the clinical decision point focused on selecting a specific antiretroviral regimen, these slides could present data on drug characteristics and potential interactions with methadone and heroin.

**Factors Limiting Use of HIV Treatment in Substance Users**

- Limited access to substance-abuse treatment programs
- Limited access to HIV care
- Complex and inadequately studied drug-drug interactions

(cont’d)

**Factors Limiting HIV Treatment in Substance Users (cont’d)**

- Underlying renal and hepatic disease
- Patient-provider attitudes
- Patient acceptance of and adherence to ART
An important part of presenting the preferred response in Step 5 is the discussion and review of alternative options. This is an opportunity to present data and demonstrate the decision-making process. Slide 13 illustrates one format for presenting each of the options not selected, accompanied by a brief explanation of why, in the context of this case study, another strategy is preferred.

**Options Not Selected: Darrel**

**Option:** Begin ART; begin PCP prophylaxis; refer to primary care clinic

**Why not?**
- Does not include substance abuse treatment
- Without addiction treatment and more information/support for patient, adherence to ART and to PCP prophylaxis is unlikely
Step 6. Introduce New Information and Continue to Next Clinical Decision Point

The previous steps describe one cycle of a case study through the resolution of a clinical decision point. The case can be used in its current length as a short vignette, or it can be moved toward a second decision point on the same patient.

Darrel’s case can continue with new information from a follow-up appointment (e.g., ongoing symptoms, adverse effects of medication, or laboratory results), leading the learner to another clinical decision point. These points can be designed to address either the same or different educational objectives. Slide 14 describes the next encounter with Darrel in the case study, and sets the stage for the second clinical decision point on Slide 15. The patient now has entered a methadone treatment program and attended an HIV clinic. Although his living situation remains unstable, he is interested in starting antiretroviral therapy. The treatment recommendation options listed on Slide 16 lead the discussion to adherence issues among substance users. One option is to set and meet an adherence goal before beginning antiretroviral therapy, such as getting a note on attendance from the methadone clinic, attending three HIV clinic appointments, or completing a trial drug regimen with jelly beans.

Continuing Case Description: Darrel

- Patient enters drug program; keeps appt at HIV clinic; tells girlfriend about HIV
- He is living in a shelter and eating irregularly; states he is taking his PCP medication
- Expresses interest in starting ART but has concerns about side effects
The issue of adherence in substance users is likely to spark controversy and debate among the audience and evoke personal and professional attitudes toward substance users. This example demonstrates the importance of good facilitation skills in addition to traditional teaching/instructing skills. Inexperienced instructors make two common mistakes in facilitating discussion. They sometimes fail to provide the direction and leadership that a learning group needs or they become over-involved in the discussion and unable to maintain the critical role of facilitator. Some facilitation strategies are offered in Table 4.

One benefit of following a single patient through a number of decision points is that it allows an audience or learner to quickly assimilate new information since the patient history is already known. Use of a continuing case reflects realistic dynamics of patient care. However, shorter vignettes with one or two brief decisions points have advantages, too. They may move a learner quickly through a variety of clinical situations.
Table 4. Strategies for Optimizing Group Discussion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strategies for Optimizing Group Discussion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Briefly clarify the purpose at the outset.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Establish norms for group interaction at the outset; request ideas or suggest guidelines (ground rules) for effective small or large group functioning. Summarize or ask someone in the group to summarize the ground rules before moving on to another topic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Model the norms throughout (i.e., respect for differences of approach or opinion when no single correct course of action is determined).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Do not reply or respond to each comment. Move to the next person wishing to comment or turn to the group for a response.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Use the experience of the group as a resource for teaching.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Actively invite ideas and suggestions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Plan your time to allow for real interaction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Do not introduce a controversial or emotionally laden topic without allowing sufficient time for a full discussion and resolution. If pressed for time, it is better to skip such content than to cut off discussion before opinions are expressed, full discussion has occurred, and a summary of points or ideas has been offered.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Create a psychologically safe climate for learning that is free of threat and judgment. Showing patience and respect for differences of opinion, questions, comments, and responses and by avoiding disapproving, sarcastic or condescending reactions.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

References

Key Points

- Teaching moments are opportunities to improve clinical skills of a health care worker, can take place in a variety of settings, and mentors should maximize the number of teaching moments at a site visit.
- Bedside and side-by-side teaching reinforce classroom learning, and allow the mentor to model clinical technique, as well as attitudes and behaviors.
- Case studies are an effective tool for clinical teaching.
Session 6: Clinical Diagnosis and Decision-Making Skills

Participant Handbook

Basics of Clinical Mentoring
Session 6: Clinical Diagnosis and Decision-Making Skills

Clock: Time: 1 hour (60 minutes)

Learning Objectives
By the end of this session, participants will be able to:
• Identify concepts of evidence-based medicine
• Identify common errors in clinical reasoning that should be avoided

Handouts
• Handout 6.1: Avoiding Errors in Clinical Reasoning

Worksheets
• Worksheet 6.2: Clinical Decision-Making Case Study

Key Points
• Resource-poor settings may lack diagnostic technology that mentors are accustomed to, so clinical reasoning skills are important.
• Nine principles of evidence-based medicine guide the clinician in diagnosis, emphasizing the most common and/or fatal potential causes, and avoiding errors in clinical reasoning.
In addition, these are principles that should be taught to/reviewed with mentees so as to improve their clinical diagnosis skills.
See Handout 6.1 for a list of the principles contained on this slide and the following slides.

**Evidence-Based Medicine: Principles (1)**

1. Occam’s Razor:
   - Advises choosing the simplest hypothesis to explain a set of clinical findings.
   - The caveat is that in immunocompromised patients, more than one pathological process may be at work.

**Evidence-Based Medicine: Principles (2)**

2. Sutton’s Law: Consider local common causes for a set of symptoms before considering uncommon causes. **vs.**

3. In contrast to Sutton’s Law, consider conditions that might kill a patient quickly, even if they are uncommon.

*When planning treatment, cover the most common causes and the most serious (life-threatening) possible causes.*

**Evidence-Based Medicine: Principles (3)**

4. Avoid premature closure of the diagnostic process—start with a broad differential diagnosis and do not eliminate possibilities without sufficient evidence.

5. Don’t be overconfident about your differential diagnoses—ask questions to disprove as well as confirm the hypothesized diagnoses.

6. Know what you don’t know, and seek out help from a book, a consultant, the Internet.
Evidence-Based Medicine: Principles (4)

7. Common diseases often have uncommon presentations, and uncommon diseases can look like very common ones. Just because a clinical presentation looks similar to Illness X does not mean that Illness X is the cause.

8. Correlation ≠ causation. Just because two findings occur together does not mean that one caused the other.

Evidence-Based Medicine: Principles (6)

9. Remember that it is common to over-diagnose conditions that we have recently seen, especially ones that are dramatic.
• **Occam’s razor** advises choosing the simplest hypothesis that explains a set of clinical findings. HOWEVER, keep in mind that when dealing with an immunocompromised patient, there may be more than one pathological process occurring at the same time in the same or in different organs.

• **Sutton’s law** (named after a famous bank robber who explained that he robbed banks because “that’s where the money is”) suggests that a clinician consider common causes in the local region for a patient’s symptoms before considering uncommon causes.

• Plan your initial empiric or syndromic treatment so that you cover the most common causes and the most serious (life threatening) possible causes.

• In contrast to Sutton’s law, consider what could kill a patient rapidly, even if that diagnosis may be uncommon.

• Avoid premature closure of your diagnostic process. Start out with a broad differential diagnosis and don’t prematurely eliminate possibilities without sufficient evidence.

• Don’t be overconfident. Seek reasons why your decisions may be wrong and consider alternative hypotheses. Ask questions that would disprove as well as prove your current hypothesis.

• Know what you don’t know. Seek the missing information (e.g., from a book, a consultant, from the Internet).

• Common diseases sometimes have uncommon presentations and uncommon diseases can sometimes look like very common ones. Just because a clinical presentation looks similar to or is “representative of” a particular illness does not prove that the cause is due to that illness.

• Remember that we tend to over diagnose conditions that we have recently seen, especially those that were particularly dramatic or in which we made a mistake that we want to avoid in the future.

• Correlation ≠ causation. Just because two findings occur together, doesn’t necessarily mean that one caused the other.
Slide 9

**Key Points**

- Resource-poor settings may lack diagnostic technology that mentors are accustomed to, so clinical reasoning skills are important.
- Nine principles of evidence-based medicine guide the clinician in diagnosis, emphasizing the most common and/or fatal potential causes and avoiding errors in clinical reasoning.

Slide 10

See Worksheet 6.2 for case study.

Slide 11

**Case Study: Clinical Decision-Making (1)**

- 50 year-old HIV-infected man comes to clinic for follow-up.
- Diagnosed with HIV infection 6 months ago, with CD4 count of 60; started ART with nevirapine 200 mg (daily for 14 days, then BID), stavudine 30 mg BID, and lamivudine 150mg BID 3 months ago.
- He has tolerated the regimen well, and reports that he takes most of the doses, but has missed numerous follow-up appointments.
- Reports fair appetite, denies weight loss, fevers, or pain, tingling, or numbness in extremities. Reports some night sweats.
Case Study: Clinical Decision-Making (3)

- Chart reveals some anemia at baseline, hemoglobin of 10. His chemistries and liver enzymes were normal before starting ART. He had reported some discolorations on his skin, but there is no further mention of this in the notes.
- In addition to ART, he is taking cotrimoxazole, 1 double-strength tablet daily. He denies medication allergies.
- His vital signs appear normal in the triage nurse’s note from today. Can he get his meds and go home?
- How should you proceed? Is the visit over?

Case Study: Clinical Decision-Making (4)

- You decide to do a quick physical exam, since it has been a while since he saw a clinician.
- You find:
  - A flat, oval, violaceous lesion on his hard palate that he was unaware of.
  - 10–15 hyperpigmented, flat, non-tender lesions scattered across his torso, back, and both arms.
  - A few hyperpigmented, flat, nodular lesions scattered on his legs.
- His lungs are clear to auscultation and percussion, cardiac rate and rhythm are regular, no cardiac murmurs.

Case Study: Clinical Decision-Making (5)

- Abdomen is soft and non-tender to palpation. Liver edge is soft and non-distended, and you don’t appreciate splenomegaly.
- Cranial nerves are normal. Examination of all four extremities shows intact pinprick and light touch sensation and 5/5 strength. His biceps, patellar, and heel deep tendon reflexes are 2+ and symmetric.
- What is your preliminary diagnosis?
- Do you think the patient is taking his ART?
- What testing would you like to perform?
- How did performing a physical exam change your management of this patient?
Worksheet 6.2: Clinical Decision-Making Case Study

Case:

50 year-old HIV-infected man comes to clinic for a follow-up visit. He was diagnosed with HIV infection 6 months ago, and had a CD4 count of 60. He started antiretroviral therapy (ART) with nevirapine 200 mg (daily for 14 days, then BID), stavudine 30 mg BID, and lamivudine 150 mg BID 3 months ago. He has tolerated the regimen well, and reports that he takes most of the doses, but has missed numerous follow-up appointments. He reports a fair appetite, denies weight loss, fevers, pain, or tingling or numbness in his extremities. He reports some night sweats. His chart reveals some anemia at baseline (hemoglobin of 10). His chemistries and liver enzymes were normal before starting ART. He had reported some discoloration on his skin, but there is no further mention of this in the notes. In addition to ART, he is taking cotrimoxazole, 1 double-strength tablet daily. He denies medication allergies. His vital signs appear normal in the triage nurse’s note from today. Can he get his meds and go home?

Question:

1. How should you proceed? Is the visit over?
   - Perform a physical exam because the patient has not seen a clinician in awhile.

Case (continued):

You decide to do a quick physical exam, since it has been a while since he saw a clinician. You find a flat, oval, violaceous lesion on his hard palate that he was unaware of; 10–15 hyperpigmented, flat, non-tender lesions scattered across his torso, back, and both arms; a few hyperpigmented, flat, nodular lesions scattered on his legs. His lungs are clear to auscultation and percussion, and his cardiac rate and rhythm are regular with no cardiac murmurs. His abdomen is soft and non-tender to palpation. His liver edge is soft and non-distended, and you don’t notice any signs of splenomegaly. Cranial nerves are normal. Examination of all four extremities shows intact pinprick and light touch sensation and 5/5 strength. His biceps, patellar, and heel deep tendon reflexes are 2+ and symmetric.

Questions:

2. What is your preliminary diagnosis?
   - Kaposi sarcoma (KS), in addition to AIDS. It is likely that the patient had KS at the time ART was started because he complained of similar lesions at the time. These may have been misdiagnosed at the time, or the patient may not have been thoroughly examined.

3. Do you think the patient is taking his antiretroviral medications (ARVs)?
   - The ARVs he is picking up every month may not be getting into his system, either because of poor adherence or he is not absorbing them from his GI tract. He may need chemotherapy in addition to ART to control his disease.
4. What testing would you like to perform?
   - Obtain a CD4 count to see if he is experiencing immunologic recovery on ART; inquire about his adherence; inquire about symptoms of malabsorption; and obtain a chest x-ray to look for signs of pulmonary KS (usually a nodular infiltrate).

5. How did performing a physical exam change your management of this patient?
   - KS would have been missed had the examiner trusted the chart and the patient’s self-report, and not performed an independent physical exam.
Case Study: Clinical Decision-Making (6)

- Preliminary diagnosis:
  Kaposi sarcoma (KS) in addition to AIDS. It is likely that the patient had KS at the time ART was started because he complained of similar lesions at the time. These may have been misdiagnosed at the time, or the patient may not have been thoroughly examined.

- Is the patient taking his ART?
  The ART he is picking up every month may not be getting into his system, either because of poor adherence or he is not absorbing it from his GI tract. He may need chemotherapy in addition to ART to control his disease.

Case Study: Clinical Decision-Making (7)

- Next testing steps:
  Obtain a CD4 count to see if he is experiencing immunologic recovery on ART; inquire about his adherence; inquire about symptoms of malabsorption; and obtain a chest x-ray to look for signs of pulmonary KS (usually a nodular infiltrate).

- How did a physical exam change the management of this patient?
  KS would have been missed had the examiner trusted the chart and the patient's self-report, and not performed an independent physical exam.

Case Study and Principles

- How does this case illustrate some of the principles we discussed in this session?
  - Occam’s Razor
  - Sutton’s Law
  - Avoid premature closure of the diagnostic process
  - Don’t be overconfident about your differential diagnoses
  - Know what you don’t know, and seek out help from a book, a consultant, the Internet
Session 7: Addressing Systems Issues

Participant Handbook
Basics of Clinical Mentoring
Session 7: Addressing Systems Issues

⏰ Time: 120 minutes (2 hours)

Learning Objectives
By the end of this session, participants will be able to:
• Identify common systems issues that exist in health care facilities
• Describe strategies to address common systems issues

📚 Handouts
• Handout 7.1: Systems Issues

Key Points
• Strengthening systems in the health care facility to support care and treatment is an important aspect of clinical mentoring.
• Systems issues in a health care facility are classified in the following categories: patient capacity, supplies, confidentiality, records/organization, and quality of care.
### Slide 1

**Session 7: Addressing Systems Issues**

Basics of Clinical Mentoring

The systems issues in this session are taken from “Strategies for Addressing Real-Life Situations in Clinical Mentoring: Adult ART Clinics” in the Tools and Resources for Mentors section of the Clinical Mentoring Toolkit.

### Slide 2

**Learning Objectives**

By the end of this session, participants will be able to:

- Identify common systems issues that exist in health care facilities
- Describe strategies to address common systems issues

### Slide 3

**Systems Issues**

- Mentoring is not just about teaching health care workers how to better administer care, but also about strengthening systems in the health care facility that support care and treatment.
- Examples of systems issues that can affect patient care and treatment:
  - Bottlenecks in patient flow
  - Missing safety equipment (e.g., gloves)
  - Lack of privacy for patients
  - No system for filing patients' medical records
Patient capacity refers to the number of patients that are able to be seen in a clinic, based on the number of doctors, nurses, and ancillary staff work in the clinic.
Handout 7.1: Systems Issues

1. **Capacity Issue**
   Long patient queues make providing effective clinical mentoring difficult.

2. **Supply Issue #1**
   Lack of general equipment at clinic (e.g., no exam table, no access to water, no electricity).

3. **Supply Issue #2**
   Universal precautions: Lack of equipment, such as gloves or masks, or improper use of available equipment.

4. **Supply Issue #3**
   First-line ART regimen is out-of-stock and cannot be replenished for another week.

5. **Confidentiality Issue**
   Lack of privacy for patients during encounter with HCW (e.g., two or three patients seen in same room, lack of confidentiality in waiting room) leads to poor adherence to follow-up care.

6. **Records/Organization Issue #1**
   No system in place to track patients who default on ART.

7. **Records/Organization Issue #2**
   Providers are not documenting clinical information in the patient’s chart.

8. **Quality of Care Issue #1**
   Lack of quality assurance methods, e.g., fellow providers are prescribing ARV medications incorrectly.

9. **Quality of Care Issue #2**
   Follow-up visit only takes ART into account; no attention is given to general medical health.

10. **Quality of Care Issue #3**
    An inadequate number of clinicians are qualified to deliver ART, resulting in unmanageable patient loads.

11. **Quality of Care Issue #4**
    Health care worker discrimination towards patients leads to patients avoiding follow-up visits.
Capacity

Issue:
- Long patient queues make providing effective clinical mentoring difficult.

Strategies:
- Mentors can sit side-by-side with mentees and assist with part of the clinic visit. For example, while mentee does focused physical exam, mentor can assist with recording the visit in the patient's record.
- Consider shifting some ART tasks, like taking history, to mid-level providers.

Capacity (cont.)

- Investigate whether stable patients coming in for ART refills could return at a longer interval, perhaps each 2–3 months.
- Implement a triage system to ‘fast track’ patients that are returning just for medication refill vs. those who have symptoms. Fast track patients should not have to see a clinician.

Supplies #1

Issue:
- Lack of general equipment at clinic (e.g., no exam table, no access to water, no electricity)

Strategies:
- Think creatively to solve such problems:
  - No electricity: Optimize use of rooms with natural light sources as exam rooms
  - No water: Get liquid sanitizers for clinic staff hand hygiene
  - No exam table: Perform exams with patient seated
Session 7: Addressing Systems Issues
Basics of Clinical Mentoring

Slide 9

Supplies #2

Issue:
- Universal precautions. Lack of equipment, such as gloves or masks, or improper use of available equipment.

Strategies:
- Request gloves and masks from Medical Director, Health Bureau, or appropriate health care authority.
- Mentors should model proper use of masks and gloves to encourage use and decrease stigma.

Slide 10

Supplies #2 (cont.)

- Display infection control information, such as posters describing cough etiquette.
- If the mentor is coming from a well-resourced setting, s/he can consider bringing reusable N95 masks and gloves.
  - While this is not sustainable, it demonstrates a commitment to infection control that may spark discussions that could lead to more sustainable interventions in the future.

Slide 11

Supplies #3

Issue:
- First-line ART regimen is out-of-stock and cannot be replenished for another week.

Strategies:
- Logistics issues:
  - One-time event or ongoing problem?
  - Is there a clear weak link in the supply chain? Is the demand at the clinic greater than the supply (i.e., an underestimate of patients on ART)?
  - Are drug stocks being stolen?
  - Establish a buffer stock, stored separately and monitored for expiration date, to be used in case of stock-outs.

There are two issues: 1) logistics, and 2) patient care.
Supplies #3 (cont.)

- Patient care issues:
  - Temporary substitution of available alternative drugs may be considered, but must be supervised by a clinician (preferably an MD) with ART experience.
  - Neighboring districts may have stocks of ART—engage the pharmacist in the district to help locate meds in other districts.

Confidentiality

**Issue:**
- Lack of privacy for patients during encounter with HCW (e.g., 2–3 patients seen in same room, lack of confidentiality in waiting room) leads to poor adherence to follow-up care

**Strategies:**
- Set up screens, sheets, or other barriers between patients to provide a degree of visual privacy.
- Implement trainings for all clinic staff on the importance of confidentiality.

Confidentiality (cont.)

- Put up posters explaining the importance of confidentiality in the waiting rooms to educate patients.
- Organize community meetings to discuss the role of stigma as a barrier for accessing care.
- Use number system for patients—patients are referred to by their patient number throughout their clinic visit, allowing for better patient anonymity.

HCW = health care worker.
Records/Organization #1

Issue:
- No system in place to track patients who default on ART

Strategies:
- Help set up defaulter tracking systems within the clinic setting
  - Start by assigning each patient a specific date and time for a follow-up appointment

Records/Organization #1 (cont.)

- Train a member of the multidisciplinary team to make a daily list of patients who miss their clinic appointments.
- Set up system for follow-up of patients in the community by using outreach workers, e.g., nurses, counselors, PLHIV, etc.

Records/Organization #2

Issue:
- Providers are not documenting clinical information in the patient's chart.

Strategies:
- Emphasize the importance of thorough documentation to improve clinic management, avoid harm to patients, and provide accurate outcome data to MOH and funders.
- Create a documentation checklist to help healthcare workers remember to record information.

Documentation checklists can exist as wall charts, pocket cards, or standardized pre-printed visit forms.
**Records/Organization #2 (cont.)**

- If they are not already implemented, introduce flow sheets for monitoring ART services, tracking medication, etc.
- Train health care workers about timely documentation of HIV activities, e.g., charting after each patient encounter or at specific times during the day.

**Solutions presented here can be mixed and matched; they are not mutually exclusive.**

**Quality of Care #1**

**Issue:**
- Lack of quality assurance methods, e.g., fellow providers are prescribing ARV medications incorrectly.
- Strategies:
  - Institute an ART committee of experts to review patient information gathered at intake visit and recommend a treatment regimen.
  - Institute regular case conference meetings for all prescribing clinicians to review all new or changed regimens.

**Quality of Care #1 (cont.)**

- Organize a chart review system to identify common problem topics to be addressed in teaching sessions, catch mistakes early.
  - Chart review should be a regular (monthly) part of the facility routine, with participation by every member of the multidisciplinary team.
  - At the end of the day or week, have clinicians gather for a case conference to go over new regimens started or changes made.
  - Refresher trainings and supportive supervision can assist in improving quality of care and services.
Quality of Care #2

Issue:
- Follow-up visit only takes ART into account; no attention to general medical health

Strategies:
- Reinforce importance of conducting quick interim history, review of systems, and targeted exam, vital signs
- Reinforce importance of reviewing the patient’s chart for non-ART related medical problems, and including questions targeting these conditions in the systems review

Quality of Care #2

- Reinforce the importance of including “prevention for positives” strategies at each visit; e.g., smoking cessation, decreasing substance use, safer sex practices to prevent STDs, etc.

Quality of Care #3

Issue:
- An inadequate number of clinicians are qualified to deliver ART, resulting in unmanageable patient loads

Strategies:
- Locate the source of the problem: Is it a lack of clinicians, or are they distracted with competing priorities?
  - Task shifting may free up valuable clinician time
  - Often, nurses and mid-level providers are highly skilled, and could manage “fast-track” or stable patients, or assume other tasks
• HCW = health care worker.
• Also, provide onsite or explore off-site “Care for Caregivers” training.

Review these characteristics that allow a mentor to be successful. These deal directly with systems issues.
Key Points

- Strengthening systems in the health care facility to support care and treatment is an important aspect of clinical mentoring.
- Systems issues in a health care facility are classified in the following categories: patient capacity, supplies, confidentiality, records/organization, and quality of care.
Session 8: Case Studies

Participant Handbook

Basics of Clinical Mentoring
Session 8: Case Studies

Time: 1/2 day

Learning Objective
By the end of this session, participants will be able to:

• Apply the clinical mentoring skills and techniques learned in this course to real-life clinical mentoring case studies

Worksheets

• Worksheet 8.1: Universal Precautions
• Worksheet 8.2: Opportunistic Infections — Basic I
• Worksheet 8.3: Opportunistic Infections — Basic II
• Worksheet 8.4: Opportunistic Infections — Advanced
• Worksheet 8.5: Palliative Care
• Worksheet 8.6: Pediatrics — Basic I
• Worksheet 8.7: Pediatrics — Basic II
• Worksheet 8.8: Pediatrics — Advanced I
• Worksheet 8.9: Pediatrics — Advanced II
• Worksheet 8.10: Prevention of Mother-to-Child Transmission I
• Worksheet 8.11: Prevention of Mother-to-Child Transmission II
• Worksheet 8.12: Sexually Transmitted Infections — Basic I
• Worksheet 8.13: Sexually Transmitted Infections — Basic II
Worksheet 8.1: Universal Precautions Case Study

Case
You are mentoring nurses in a hospital ward. A 42-year old patient was admitted to the hospital medical ward with a prolonged cough, weight loss, and night sweats. You suspect tuberculosis (TB) treatment failure, because he was started on anti-TB therapy (ATT) 3 months ago. The nurse proceeds to collect a sputum sample wearing a surgical mask.

Questions

1. What are your top concerns regarding medical diagnosis?

2. Were universal precautions appropriately followed for this patient?
Case (continued)

You talk with the nurses at the nurses’ station, and enquire why they did not isolate the patient. They reply that they never considered isolating the patient because the windows are open at the far end of the ward.

Question

3. How would you respond to this situation?
Case

A 44-year old man is seen the exam room by the clinic doctor near the end of the day. He presented to clinic that morning with a 2-week history of worsening shortness of breath. He has had a head cold with nasal congestion and a lot of sputum for several days, but today his cough is dry. He feels weak, shaky and short of breath at rest. He started running a fever yesterday and has pain on the right side of his chest. He has a headache and his appetite is poor. He has not been out of bed much in the past several days, because he gets dizzy when he stands. He smokes about 10 cigarettes per day, when he can get them.

His last CD4 count was 165 and he is not yet taking antiretroviral therapy (ART) because he is on his last month of treatment for pulmonary TB, which he has adhered to faithfully. His only other medicine is sulfamethoxazole/trimethoprim which he takes “most days” for PCP prophylaxis. The patient is able to provide this history himself, and although he is weak, does not appear to be acutely short of breath. The mentor and the clinic doctor examine the patient. He appears weak and pale. His skin and mucous membranes are dry. His vital signs are as follows: pulse—120 at rest, blood pressure—88/54, respirations—24, temperature—39°C. A chest exam reveals a few scattered coarse crackles, with predominance at the right base. The doctor seeing the patient and the clinical mentor agree upon a diagnosis of pneumonia, and decide that the patient needs to be admitted. In this hospital, the clinic doctors do not follow the admitted patients. The clinic doctor has called the admitting doctor who will come to see the patient as soon as she can. The clinic doctor is ready to move on to the next patient.

Questions

1. What should the mentor suggest the clinic doctor do while waiting for the patient to be admitted?

2. What valuable lesson can be taught from this scenario?
Worksheet 8.3: Opportunistic Infections Case Study—Basic II

Case
A 27-year old man is brought to clinic by his sister. He tested positive for HIV 2 years ago and came to the HIV clinic once shortly after testing, but never returned. His CD4 count at that single visit was 118. His sister, who is also a patient at the clinic, brought him in because of a headache, which has gradually increased over the past 3 weeks. The problem first started as neck stiffness and then became a generalized dull pain in the whole head. Today the pain is excruciating. The man has difficulty sitting, is irritable and he does not want to talk. Physical examination shows an emaciated man with oral thrush. He is not disoriented but is drowsy. Deep tendon reflexes are brisk and equal. There are no lateralizing signs on his neurological exam. Fundoscopic examination reveals bilateral papilledema.

Questions

1. What is the most likely serious opportunistic infection affecting this man?

2. How does one diagnose this illness?

3. Will a CT scan be helpful?

4. Does the papilledema make a difference in this case?
Case (continued)
You and the mentee decide to perform a lumbar puncture. You decide to run the following routine tests: VDRL, glucose, protein, cell count, culture, gram stain and India ink stain.

Questions

5. What benefits can a lumbar puncture offer?

6. What treatment options are preferred?

Case (continued)
The mentee asks you to do the lumbar procedure because he has to go to a meeting. You’ve noticed a pattern developing with the mentee. Whenever there is a major procedure to work on, he makes an excuse to leave and asks you to do the procedure instead.

Questions

7. How would you handle this situation?
Case

A 35-year old woman presents to the always busy adult HIV clinic for a routine follow-up appointment and medication refill. She denies any problems with her medications and a review of her medical passport indicates that she picks up her medications in a timely fashion each month. Her CD4 count is now 235, up from 27 when she started ART 12 months ago. Her weight is unchanged. She tells the male doctor who is working with the mentor that day that she has no problems or concerns. She is sent to the nurse for routine, scheduled blood tests. The nurse comes back to the doctor to report that the patient complained to her about severe vaginal itching, and that she has been bleeding after having sex. The doctor, who was just leaving for lunch, tells the nurse to have the patient come back in a month if she continues to have these problems.

At this point, the mentor intervenes, suggesting that the patient could be seen after lunch, and that a more specific history and vaginal exam are indicated. The patient returns and a more detailed history reveals that she has had a moderate white vaginal discharge for 2 weeks accompanied by itching, and she has been having some irregular vaginal bleeding for 4 months with spotting or mild bleeding every time she has intercourse. Sex has become painful in the past month. Other than her husband, she has had only one sexual partner; he is a truck driver who is home only one or two nights each week. They have three healthy children. Her last regular period ended 3 days ago.

Questions

1. Should the mentor have intervened in this case or should the patient have been allowed to come back in a month?
Case (continued)

The doctor decides to perform a pelvic exam. Fortunately, the clinic is equipped to provide this service. The exam reveals some flat warts on the patient’s vulva. There are white exudates on the walls of the vagina and a white curd-like discharge is present. There is no blood in the vault but the cervix is very friable and begins to bleed during the exam. The doctor tells the patient that her cervix looks a little unusual and asks her if she has ever had a Pap smear. Her reply is, “What is a Pap smear?” The mentor who has been reviewing the patient’s medical passport is unable to find any notations regarding a Pap smear. The doctor performs the Pap smear, although these are not usually done in the clinic. The doctor also asks permission to take samples for a routine sexually transmitted infections (STI) check-up, completes the exam, and then permits the patient to get dressed. The doctor then checks that the patient’s contact information is correct and asks her return in 1 month to get the results of her tests. Also, an antifungal vaginal cream is prescribed for the patient.

Questions

2. What factors put this patient at risk for cervical cancer?

3. What can the mentor do at this point to help this patient and the clinic?
Worksheet 8.5: Palliative Care Case Study

Case

Tewodros is a 45-year old man who was first diagnosed with HIV about 4 years ago. He is married and has four small children. He works in the city but his family is living several hundred kilometers from the city in a rather remote area. For 3 months, Tewodros has been taking D4T/3TC and EFV. His initial response was good and his CD4 count that was initially 50 was improving. He also noted that he had increased energy level and significant weight gain.

However, now at month four, he returns to the clinic and you note a change in his condition. He is now complaining of severe pain in his feet. He said he lost his job because he had trouble standing, which is required for his job. He is feeling very depressed about this, especially since he does not know how he can take care of his family without a job. He said that he does not want to take his medicines anymore because of this.

You are mentoring a senior physician in the clinic. When the patient reports his symptoms of pain and depression, the physician writes him a prescription for ibuprofen and tells him not to worry about all of this. The physician then motions to the nurse in the room to call in the next patient.

Question

1. How would you as the mentor intervene in this situation?
Case

A 28-year old woman brings her 5-year old niece to clinic. She has taken care of this girl since her sister, her niece’s mother, died of a wasting illness 3 years ago. The girl has been chronically ill with recurring pneumonia and diarrhea. She is small for her age and quite thin.

In the clinic, a rapid HIV test is ordered and the result is positive.

Question

1. At what stage of AIDS is this child?

Case (continued)

When the mentee receives the positive HIV test result he looks confused. He starts looking uncomfortably at the aunt and the patient.

Questions

2. How would you intervene with this issue of pediatric disclosure?

3. What tests would you suggest the clinic doctor order?

4. What treatment and what advice would you recommend?
Worksheet 8.7: Pediatrics Case Study – Basic II

Case

A 20-month old girl was born to an HIV seropositive mother. At the time of delivery, both the mother and child were asymptomatic. The mother received prophylactic nevirapine but the baby received none. At birth, the child weighed 2,400 g. Today, she weighs 7 kg.

The mother is bringing the baby in for her third clinic visit. You note that the baby walks but does not talk. She has had several bouts of bacterial skin infection, and once she had pneumonia, which was treated with penicillin. Today, her mother has brought the child in because she doesn’t seem as active as other children. She notices that her weight is less than the weight of other girls of the same age. She has no diarrhea or vomiting. Upon examination, the girl has no fever, but has a few small lymph nodes and a few scattered umbilicated papules on her abdomen which her mother says are increasing in number. She also has white patches in her mouth that can be scraped off with a tongue blade. Her mother says she has noticed these off and on for several weeks.

Questions

1. Will a rapid HIV test be a reasonably reliable way to determine if this child is infected with HIV? At what age does maternal antibody generally disappear?

2. How would you determine if this child’s growth retardation is due to immunosuppression? Is a simple CD4 count adequate?
Case (continued)

You notice that the infant has been displaying signs and symptoms of possible HIV infection since her first clinic visit a few months ago. These signs include developmental delays, growth retardation, and likely oral thrush and other recurrent infections.

Questions

3. How will you use this opportunity to teach your mentee about HIV testing for exposed infants (born to HIV-infected mothers)?

4. What is the best way to insure that this child has a good chance of survival?
Case

Your mentee asks you to see a 32-month old boy brought to the outpatient pediatric clinic because of weakness and failure to thrive. He is 3 kg below his expected weight for age. The physical examination reveals an afebrile, fussy child who does not like to be touched. Although his abdomen is protuberant, there is no palpable liver. His lungs are clear. He has scaly lesions on his legs. He and his mother have never been tested for HIV. He lives at home in the poorest part of town with his mother, father, two older sisters, and grandmother. Everyone at home is well; his grandmother was sick last year, but took medicine of an unknown type and has recovered. His mother says he does not have diarrhea, but his appetite is poor.

Question

1. What working differential diagnosis should your mentee be considering in this child?

Case (continued)

The child is admitted to hospital with a diagnosis of protein-energy malnutrition. The white blood count (WBC) and differential are normal. The hemoglobin is 9.5 g/dl. A chest x-ray is normal. Stool studies have been collected and are pending. Your mentee, the doctor caring for the child, suggests that an HIV rapid test be done on the child. The parents are not available to give permission for the test, so the test is postponed until the parents are available. He is given vitamins and a nutritious porridge rich in protein and carbohydrates. After 2 weeks in the hospital, there is no change in the child’s condition. He seems to have no appetite, and he continues to be sullen and fussy.

Question

2. What error was made on the first clinic visit?
Case (continued)

The mentee finally encounters the child’s mother on the pediatric ward. She refuses to grant permission for an HIV test because she says if it is positive it would indicate that she also is infected with HIV. She doesn’t want to know. Eventually, the child’s father comes and the mentee calls you to talk with the father. You persuade the father to give permission for his son’s HIV test. He says that he mostly wants to know if his wife is infected, and that this is the best way to know the truth about her. The rapid HIV test is done on the boy. The result is negative.

Question

3. Now what is the most likely diagnosis for the child? How would you direct the mentee to proceed?

Case (continued)

Within 7 days of starting TB treatment, the child begins to eat and gain weight. Fortunately for this young patient, he has two treatable illnesses and improvement in his condition can be forthcoming. After 8 weeks of induction treatment, the child is ready to be discharged on continuation phase TB medications.

Question

4. The mentee comes to you with concerns about sending this child home with the parents who did not seem adequately concerned about the child’s health at the time of admission. How would you advise the mentee to proceed?
Case

You are working as a clinical mentor in a busy hospital-based HIV center. There are separate pediatric and adult HIV clinics serviced by one ARV pharmacy. Several full-time doctors are assigned to the adult clinic, and one full-time pediatrician assisted occasionally by a member of the house staff is assigned to the pediatric side of the clinic. There are a number of nurses working in both sides of the clinic, most of whom specialize in either adult or pediatric care. You are working to mentor all of the doctors in the clinic.

The pediatrician in the HIV center suddenly goes on medical leave. The hospital administrator is able to send a member of the house staff to work in the pediatric clinic only two half days per week. This is not adequate to keep up with the flow of patients through the clinic; there are several hundred children who get their care at this clinic, many of whom are on ARVs. Although it is not your primary responsibility, you are called upon to help figure out a solution to this situation.

Question

1. Describe several options on how to proceed at this point.
Worksheet 8.10: Prevention of Mother-to-Child Transmission I

Case
You are mentoring a group of nurses on the postpartum ward. A 31-year old HIV-infected mother had a healthy baby boy 2 days ago, and is scheduled to be discharged this afternoon. (Both the mother and baby took prevention of mother-to-child [PMTCT] prophylactic regimens).

During the morning, you notice that the nurse taking care of the patient is barely speaking to her. Later, you notice the nurse being extremely rude and unprofessional with the mother when she asks for some water to drink.

You take the nurse aside and tell her that there are several important counseling messages that she should be teaching the patient before she leaves. You ask the nurse why she is behaving in such a hostile manner with the patient.

The nurse answers that this mother should have never become pregnant. “Look at how she put her poor infant in possible danger because of her foolishness. HIV-positive women should never be allowed to have children.”

Questions

1. How would you intervene at this juncture?

2. In terms of postpartum counseling, what are some important messages that you would like to address with the mother?

3. What should the mentee be teaching the patient regarding feeding her newborn?
Worksheet 8.11: Prevention of Mother-to-Child Transmission II

Case
You are mentoring nurses in the maternity ward. Rose, a 29-year old woman in her third pregnancy, delivered a healthy, 3.5 kg baby girl an hour after she arrived at the maternity ward. After the birth, she told the staff she had a positive HIV-test result (done at the clinic), but did not take the tablet given to her before rushing to the maternity because she did not want her family to know about her HIV infection.

Questions

1. What treatment does Rose require now?

2. What treatment does her baby require?

Case (continued)
Rose is reluctant to disclose her HIV positive status to her husband because she fears his reaction. The local HIV physician at the clinic commented in a multidisciplinary meeting that “the husband should be told of her HIV status to protect him. The husband needs to get tested even if it is against her wishes.”

3. How would you as a mentor intervene in this situation?
Worksheet 8.12: STI Case Study — Basic I

Case

A 38-year-old woman returns to clinic because of the recurrence of painful sores on the labia minor and painful intercourse. She had similar lesions last year, but this year there are more sores and the pain is worse. In addition, she has experienced a whitish vaginal discharge which aggravates the sores. The woman washes dishes and cleans in a restaurant. Recently, she could not work because of her discomfort and tiredness.

The clinic on this particular day has a long line of patients waiting to be seen.

The mentee that you are with prescribes a vaginal yeast cream for the patient and tells her to come back to the clinic in 2 weeks for follow up.

Question

1. How would you intervene in this particular scenario?

Case (continued)

Upon inspection, there are about one dozen lesions, which appear as discrete 2–4 mm ulcers on a reddish base. There has been no weight loss or other general findings.

Questions

2. What type of genital ulcers does she likely have?

3. What WHO stage of HIV is she at?
4. What treatment will you prescribe?

Case (continued)
Throughout the pelvic exam, you noticed that people kept knocking on the door and poking their heads into the exam room. You are upset by the lack of privacy for this patient.

Question

5. How would you intervene in this situation?
Worksheet 8.13: STI Case Study—Basic II

Case
You are working with a physician mentor at one of the larger HIV clinics in the city. Today there are only two providers at the clinic. Normally there are four providers, but the other two are out due to illness.

A 21-year-old HIV infected man comes to the clinic because he noted a sore on the shaft of his penis 3 days ago. This sore does not hurt. He tried to wash the sore several times, but it does not improve. He reports that he had sexual intercourse with a new partner 2 weeks ago. The physician prescribes acyclovir therapy without doing a comprehensive exam. The only part of the physical that is done consists of your mentee looking briefly in the patient’s mouth from across the desk. You are alarmed because the physician may miss important diagnostic clues or other conditions by omitting a physical exam.

Question

1. How would you intervene as the mentor in this situation?

Case (continued)
The mentee answers that he refuses to do genital exams on the patient because there are no gloves in the room or sinks with running water.

Question

2. How would you respond to the problem of a lack of supplies in the clinic?
Session 9: Program Orientation

Participant Handbook

Basics of Clinical Mentoring
Session 9: Program Orientation

Time: ½ day*

Learning Objective

By the end of this session, participants will be able to:

- Explain the background and details of the country program in which they will be working in order to provide appropriate and applicable clinical mentoring

Session Overview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Resources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1/2 day*</td>
<td>Activity</td>
<td>Program Orientation to (no slides)</td>
<td>Orientation Tools (as identified)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*The format and content of this session will vary based on the setting and context in which clinical mentoring will take place, and the particular needs of the clinical mentor group that is being trained/oriented.